

January 25, 1996

## SUMMARY CONCLUSIONS

### 13th APEC-HRD WORKING GROUP MEETING Wellington, New Zealand January 21-25, 1996

1. The 13th APEC Human Resources Development (HRD) Working Group Meeting and the Network Meetings were held in Wellington, New Zealand, on January 21 - 25, 1996. 120 delegates attended from Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, People's Republic of China, Hong Kong, Indonesia, Japan, Republic of Korea, Malaysia, Mexico, New Zealand, Papua New Guinea, Republic of Philippines, Singapore, Chinese Taipei, Thailand and the United States of America. The APEC Secretariat and the Pacific Economic Cooperation Council (PECC) were also represented at the meeting.
2. The meeting was co-chaired by Ms. Kathy O'Hara, the Lead Shepherd of the Working Group, and Mr. Lyall Perris, HRD 13 Host.

#### OPENING REMARKS

3. The Host formally thanked Dr. Macaranas, the current APEC SOM Chair and Outgoing Lead Shepherd, for the time and effort spent leading the APEC HRD Working Group.
4. On behalf of the HRD Working Group, a plaque was presented to Dr. Macaranas with the following inscription: "Dr. Macaranas, in appreciation of his valued contribution as Lead Shepherd of the APEC HRD Working Group, Wellington, New Zealand, 24 January 1996".
5. The Lead Shepherd formally welcomed all Working Group members and mentioned that she looked forward to getting to know them better. She noted that the role of the Lead Shepherd is to ensure that the Working Group moves toward the common goals set by the Leaders and Ministers, while recognizing the diversity of the APEC region. She recalled the achievements of her predecessor and indicated her hope that the agenda and management of the Working Group would continue to evolve over the coming years. The Lead Shepherd expressed her intention to learn about the organization, indicating there might be some benefits from being a newcomer who asks questions such as "What structures does the Working Group currently have and why?", and; "Where is the Working Group going in the future?" She encouraged delegates to share their views on these questions with her during or after the meeting.

#### FORMATION OF A DRAFTING COMMITTEE

6. The meeting approved the proposal for a drafting committee.

#### SYNOPSIS OF MEETINGS TO DATE AND ADOPTION OF AGENDA

7. The Host summarized the discussion from January 22, during which the reports of the outgoing Lead Shepherd and SOM Chair and the APEC Secretariat were presented. The Network Coordinators outlined their preliminary reactions to these reports, and five questions were presented to focus the discussion of the Networks and the Working Group.
8. The proceedings of the plenary session on Monday, January 22, 1996 appear as ANNEX 1.
9. The proposed agenda was approved and appears as ANNEX 2.

## REVIEW OF PROGRESS OF HRD WORKING GROUP NETWORKS

### A) Report on Business Management Network (BMN) (Canada)

10. The BMN Coordinator reported on the progress of the 19 projects currently underway in the Network, including outputs of projects on change management, business investment in training and development and teaching case study development, respectively. Reports that were presented to the Network are available to Working Group members.
11. The meeting took note of the BMN progress report and summary of discussion which appear as ANNEX 3.

### B) Report on Education Forum (USA)

12. The Coordinator for the Education Forum indicated that its meeting had accomplished three principal objectives: to review the progress of all Education Forum projects; to establish procedures for developing a long-range strategic plan for future work; and to respond to the set of procedural questions addressed to the Forum and the Networks by the HRD Working Group.
13. She reviewed key projects within the Forum, whose meeting also included a two-hour policy dialogue on national monitoring of student achievement and participation in two technology demonstrations. She indicated that the Education Forum had formed a drafting committee to develop a strategic plan which will form the core of a report to Education Ministers. It would also be an appropriate vehicle for reporting to other APEC Ministers and fora on the Forum's accomplishments and plans.
14. She noted that the Education Forum members were generally supportive of the proposal to form an internal mechanism to facilitate communication and planning within the HRD Working Group.
15. The Coordinator introduced the incoming Coordinator, Mrs. Savitri Suwansathit, Deputy Permanent Secretary for Education of Thailand, who will co-chair the 8th Forum meeting and chair subsequent meetings.
16. The meeting noted the report which appear as ANNEX 4.

### C) Report on Human Resources Development for Industrial Technology Report (HURDIT) (Chinese Taipei)

17. The HURDIT Coordinator reported on the major proceedings of the 6th HURDIT Meeting, which was held on 22-23 January 1996 in conjunction with the 13th APEC HRD Working Group Meeting. He reported on the achievements in the Network since the 5th Meeting in Beijing, May 1995.
18. The HURDIT Coordinator highlighted the alignment of current HURDIT projects with the Osaka Action Agenda HRD themes and the priority measures called for in the Joint Statement from the HRD Ministerial in Manila in January 1996.
19. The HURDIT Coordinator presented the Network responses to the five questions discussed on January 22nd.
20. The Meeting noted the HURDIT report which appears as ANNEX 5.

### D) Report on Network for Economic Development Management (NEDM) (Philippines)

21. The NEDM Coordinator reported on the completed projects of the Network, its review of three key reports and their implications for the Network and for HRD in APEC. He reported that

NEDM discussed projects in the pipeline for 1996 and 1997, and stressed the need to align them with Leaders' and Ministers' priorities. The Coordinator noted NEDM's suggestion for a coordinating committee on labour market information and its offer to take the lead in this effort.

22. NEDM agreed to limit the term for its Coordinator to two years, with the Deputy Coordinator expected to be named at HRD 14 in Brunei Darussalam.
23. The meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 6.

#### REVIEW OF CROSS-CUTTING THEMES

##### A) Report on SME Coordinating Meeting (NEDM Coordinator)

24. The NEDM Coordinator noted that the many activities related to SMEs ranged from the Ad Hoc Policy Level Group on SMEs and Ministerial Meetings to symposia and seminars on SMEs.
25. The committee recognized the need to align APEC HRD SME activities with the policy framework of the SME Ministerial Meeting and to link activities with the Ad Hoc Policy Level Group on SMEs. The Meeting noted the desirability of developing a list of SME-related projects and a coordinating group to provide more in-depth information about each SME activity.
26. The meeting noted the report on the SME coordinating committee which appears as ANNEX 7.

##### B) Report on Sustainable Development Coordinating Meeting (BMN Coordinator)

27. The BMN Coordinator reported on the meeting of the Environmental Projects Coordinating Committee, including progress made in implementing the projects currently underway in three Networks, suggestions for future directions and the importance of linking with other APEC fora active in this area.
28. The BMN Coordinator mentioned the publication of a report on economic impact and sustainable development and related the desire of the coordinating group to have the learning contained in the report implemented in due course throughout the APEC region.
29. The BMN Coordinator reported on the results of an informal meeting of project Coordinators who discussed joint dissemination of project results to date to the meeting of APEC Environmental and Economic Officials in March 1996, the APEC Sustainable Development Ministerial in July, 1996 and through a conference proposed for early 1997.
30. The meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 8.

##### C) Report on Life Long Learning Coordinating Meeting (HURDIT Coordinator)

31. The HURDIT Coordinator reported on the Lifelong Learning project of the HURDIT Network. Its three elements are: developing a database of scholars, practitioners, researchers and policy personnel with an interest in lifelong learning; producing a book of papers related to lifelong learning; and holding a lifelong learning conference in late 1997. Input to the database and publication were encouraged.
32. The HURDIT Coordinator outlined future approaches to the topic of lifelong learning, noting that the Working Group had agreed to discuss the issue again at its next meeting.
33. The meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 9.

## REVIEW OF HRD RELATED LEADERS AND MINISTERIAL INITIATIVES

### A) Report on APEC Leaders' Education Initiative (USA)

34. The USA presented the report on the APEC Leaders' Education Initiative. At its inception in 1993, the Education Initiative had three components: (a) Study Centers, (b) scholarships for exchanges of scholars, and (c) additional activities such as: joint research, seminars, networking, and university and cultural exchanges. In 1994, APEC Ministers added two components to the Initiative: the Education Foundation and the Education Telecommunication Network.
35. The USA noted that Study Centers are interdisciplinary, graduate-level research centers which undertake research on short and long-term basis on policy issues of importance to APEC Leaders, such as liberalization of trade and investment, environmental protection, and infrastructure. The Telecommunication Network will link the Study Centers with multi-media technology, including video-conferencing and thus energize intellectual integration within APEC.
36. The meeting noted the report on the APEC Leaders' Education Initiative which appears as ANNEX 10.
37. Papua New Guinea reported that the establishment of an APEC Study Centre was being considered by the Papua New Guinea University of Technology.
38. Japan reported on international conferences it had hosted in March and September 1995 to promote APEC Study Centres.

### B) Report on APEC Business Volunteer Program (Thailand)

39. Thailand reminded the participants that they had announced at HRD 12 their intention to establish a BVP coordinating office in Bangkok. This proposal was presented at the second SOM in 1995, and an amended proposal was endorsed by Ministers in Osaka. This proposal is to be implemented in 1996. The BMN Coordinator congratulated Thailand on the progress of the BVP and reiterated that BMN was eager to contribute to the initiative. Thailand expressed its willingness to work with BMN and the HRD Working Group.
40. The meeting noted the report on the BVP initiative which appears as ANNEX 11.

### C) Report on the APEC Centre for Technology Exchange Training for SMEs (ACTETSME) (Philippines)

41. The Philippines reported that invitations to the ACTETSME organizational workshop to be held on March 13-15, 1996 in Metro Manila were sent on January 5, 1996, to APEC member economies. The workshop will define the organizational structure and the operational plan for ACTETSME. Comments on the workshop's proposed agenda are due by January 31, 1996.
42. The meeting noted the report on ACTETSME which appears as ANNEX 12.

### D) Report on SME Ministerial (Australia)

43. Australia reported that the second meeting of APEC SME Ministers was held in Adelaide on 14-15 September 1995. Key outcomes of the meeting included a commitment by all APEC SME Ministers to the Bogor Declaration; the finalisation of an action program on SMEs which was subsequently endorsed by the APEC Leaders in Osaka; and a free-flowing session between Ministers on issues of concern to SMEs, including human resources development.

44. The agreed SME Action Program places an important emphasis on HRD. SME Ministers agreed that opportunities should be expanded for the development of SME human resource capabilities, especially in entrepreneurship, business and managerial skills, technical capabilities, technology sharing, linguistic skills, understanding different cultures and knowledge of business practices and legal requirements should be expanded. Two HRD projects were approved: an APEC SME Leaders Workshop and an APEC Franchising Study to help enhance the understanding of APEC SMEs of the benefits of systems based on a business franchise format.

45. The meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 13.

**E) Update on Sustainable Development Ministerial (Philippines)**

46. The Philippines provided a progress report for a conference proposed by President Ramos to focus on innovative approaches related to the issue of sustainable development. The Philippines reviewed a number of initiatives to prepare for the APEC Ministerial Meeting on Sustainable Development which will be held July 11-12, 1996. Preparations for this Ministerial will be advanced at a meeting of APEC Environment and Economic Officials in Vancouver (26-28 March 1996) on the margins of *Globe 96*.

47. The meeting noted the report of the Philippines which appears as ANNEX 14.

**F) APEC Education Foundation (USA)**

48. The USA provided a progress report to the HRD Working Group including background on the APEC Education Foundation, its Board of Governors and Advisory Council, its World Wide Web site, grant priorities and project proposal requirements. New Zealand informed the HRD Working Group that it has nominated a representative to the Foundation. The first round of grants is tentatively scheduled to be made in July 1996. The Foundation will support activities which link economic enterprises and academic institutions throughout the Asia Pacific region in collaborative undertakings. It will explore ways to avoid duplication and overlap with the APEC Secretariat, HRD Working Group and the APEC Study Centres.

49. Funding for the Foundation is being sought on a voluntary basis, including donations from each APEC member economy. The Foundation will use seed money to attract additional funding, and to create coalitions of support for good ideas. Funds for the Foundation's endowment are being solicited, two-thirds being committed to creating a permanent endowment and the balance directed to current grant making and operations. The Foundation will administer a special Fund for Educational Mobility to underwrite the travel expenses of researchers, scholars, and students between APEC economies.

50. Participation of the Foundation at HRD Working Group meetings will be guided by SOM procedures.

51. Korea reported that it is actively working with the USA in organizing the Foundation.

52. The meeting noted the report on the Foundation which appears as ANNEX 15.

**G) Partners for Progress (Japan)**

53. At the APEC Ministerial Meeting in Osaka, Ministers agreed to introduce and utilize PFP as a new mechanism, based on mutual assistance and voluntarism, to promote economic and technical cooperation more efficiently within APEC. The emphasis is on projects supporting trade and investment liberalization and facilitation such as those on: (1) standards and conformance, (2) industrial property rights and (3) competition policy. Japan indicated its desire to involve all member economies in the PFP process.

54. The meeting noted the update on the PFP which appears as ANNEX 16.
55. The PRC tabled its preliminary proposal to the PFP for a project by the China APEC Study Centre on joint training and research, as well as a symposium on trade and investment facilitation issues.
56. The meeting noted the PFP project proposal from PRC which appears as ANNEX 17.

#### H) Partnership for Education & Training (Japan)

57. Japan provided an update on the JAPAN-APEC Partnership for Education and Training (JAPET) program which provides information to students from the APEC region who hope to be employed in Japan, and cultivates corporations and other organizations which are willing to offer employment to students from the APEC region.
58. The meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 18.

#### I) UMAP (Australia)

59. Australia provided an update on UMAP. It reported the outcome of the UMAP Working Party meeting held in Christchurch: an agreement to develop a strategic plan for UMAP; establishing a better base for statistical collection; collecting information on courses in English and on financial support/scholarships; and developing a proposal for a UMAP clearing house for exchanges. The next meeting of the UMAP Reference Group is to be held in Auckland on 20-23 August 1996.
60. The Meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 19.

#### J) APEC Vocational Training Program (Korea)

61. Korea presented its implementation plan for the APEC Vocational Training Program, which will conduct further training of instructors and the establishment of a vocational training information Network in 1997.
62. The Meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 20.

#### K) PECC HRD Outlook (PECC)

63. The representative of PECC presented a progress report on PECC/APEC collaboration on labour market issues.
64. The meeting noted the report which appears as ANNEX 21.

#### Video Presentation

65. Australia presented a video entitled "Improving understanding of culture" which is part of a project being developed through the Education Forum as a resource kit for school children aged 10 to 12 years. It comprises a student handbook, teachers guide, video and CD-ROM. Working Group members were invited to forward comments on the project to Australia.

#### FUTURE DIRECTIONS OF THE ACTION PROGRAM FOR HRD IN APEC

66. The Lead Shepherd opened the plenary discussion on the following five questions which had been discussed by the Networks:

- 1) How should the HRD Action Program be revised/updated to reflect the direction from Leaders in the APEC Leaders' Declaration for Action from Osaka in November 1995?

- 2) How should the Action Program be revised/updated to reflect the Joint Statement from the HRD Ministerial in Manila in January 1996?
  - 3) What "down payments" on these Osaka and Manila statements can be made through the Network's current activities, its workplan for 1997, and looking ahead, in its 1998 workplan?
  - 4) What specific linkages or relational arrangements can be made with other APEC fora at (a) the Ministerial level (b) the Working Group level (c) the Network level (d) the project level?
  - 5) What kinds of policies, management, and integrative processes can be built into the design and implementation of Network projects and in the operation of the Working Group?
67. The APEC Secretariat reviewed a recently received report on disbursement of APEC funds by the HRD Working Group. The Working Group noted the need for Networks to monitor efficiently the disbursement of APEC central funds in relation to approved projects.
  68. The Meeting noted the report of the APEC Secretariat on Disbursement which appears as ANNEX 22.

#### Follow-up to the Osaka Action Agenda and the Manila HRD Ministerial Meeting

69. In response to Questions 1, 2 and 3, the four Network Coordinators referred to key joint activities already underway, as the basis for the Working Group's collective response. They suggested that only relatively minor changes to the Action Program for HRD were required in light of the HRD Ministerial Meeting in Manila earlier this month. BMN suggested that additional work might be desirable on the issue of capital market formation. NEDM offered to establish a number of activities in conjunction with PECC and other fora. It also recommended developing new projects on occupational health and safety, as well as in the areas of lifelong learning and gender analysis. HURDIT indicated its intention to propose a new project on the comparative standards of technical skills in APEC economies.
70. The meeting recognized the Korean proposal to hold the 1997 HRD Ministerial meeting in Korea. Korea will report on a detailed schedule for this Ministerial Meeting at the next Working Group meeting. The meeting noted the Korean proposal to include the APEC vocational training program in the updated Action Program.
71. The five priorities identified at the APEC HRD Ministerial Meeting were accepted as a new initiative of the HRD Working Group. Based on the discussion in the Network meetings and during the plenary meeting, active response to the five priorities by the HRD Working Group would be led as follows:
  - a) Analysis of Labour Market Issues: by interested member economies under the guidance of the HRD Working Group coordinating mechanism, with contributions by NEDM;
  - b) Management and Strengthening of SMEs: by the SME Coordinating Committee;
  - c) Facilitating Mobility of Persons and Information Exchange for HRD and Economic Growth: by the Education Forum and HURDIT;
  - d) Liberalization and Facilitation of Trade in Services: by interested member economies under the guidance of the HRD Working Group coordinating mechanism, with contributions by Networks, recognizing the role of other APEC fora such as the Committee on Trade and Investment on this issue; and
  - e) Executive Education and Development: by BMN.

72. Australia reminded the Working Group of PECC's existing collaboration and its offer to contribute to LMI.
73. The Working Group noted the following suggestions by member economies regarding how to respond to the five priorities:

a) it was suggested that a coordinating committee be established with respect to Analysis of Labour Market Issues. A scoping of the work to be done will proceed as quickly as possible; the Philippines offered to host an informal meeting in Manila. Canada indicated it would be willing to host an inaugural meeting of experts from LMI focal institutions.

b) with respect to Liberalisation and Facilitation of Trade in Services, the People's Republic of China suggested that the focus should be on the facilitation of cooperation in education and training among member economies.

#### Linkages among APEC Fora

74. In response to the question on improving linkages with other APEC fora, it was agreed that the best way to do so was to create a positive environment for these linkages to occur. Suggested means include extending the role of the APEC Secretariat to disseminate more information, creating an HRD Working Group newsletter to be shared with APEC fora, wider dissemination of HRD Working Group products and project proposals, and development of joint proposals with other APEC fora.
75. It was agreed that the APEC Secretariat should be requested, on a priority basis, to enter information on HRD, SMEs and sustainable development into an APEC Activities Database, with particular emphasis on projects at the design stage, or which are about to be implemented.

#### Enhanced Management

76. In order to improve project management, it was proposed that, in addition to conforming to the criteria for assessment of APEC Projects as outlined in Annex I to SOM 7.4.b., dated October 12, 1995, all HRD Working Group project proposals seeking central funding should use a common format that includes the items below.
- (a) Product: The proposal should indicate clearly the intended goal, result, or product of the project.
- (b) Relevance: The proposal should explain clearly how the goal, result or product of the project contributes to specific priorities identified in the Osaka Action Agenda and the Action Program for HRD or in their future revisions.
- (c) Performance Indicators: The proposal should identify a clear schedule for implementation, specific performance indicators, and milestone points that can be used for assessment of the progress of the project and achievement of its goal, result or product through a set of measurement targets and indicators.
- (d) Evaluation Strategy: The proposal should describe clearly how the performance indicators will be used for the monitoring and evaluation of the project, the measurement of progress in achieving the project's intended goal, result, or product, and the reporting process that will be used to assess the outcome of the project.
- (e) Dissemination and Communication: The proposal should include a budgeted plan for the publication and dissemination of results.
77. All Networks should be encouraged to use this format in preparing their project proposals for HRD 14 in Brunei Darussalam. The HRD coordinating mechanism should review the proposal in



light of the new format for applications for BAC funding to be promulgated shortly so that the proposal can be discussed at the next meeting of the HRD Working Group.

78. The Working Group acknowledged the need for an internal mechanism to coordinate and plan activities between Working Group meetings. Recognizing the consensus-based principles of APEC, the mandate of such a coordinating mechanism would include:
- a) providing advice and assistance in drafting procedural papers for consideration by the HRD Working Group;
  - b) guiding the development of procedures to strengthen the Working Group and increase its effectiveness;
  - c) supporting the Lead Shepherd in responding to HRD issues emerging from other APEC fora;
  - d) planning and preparing for Working Group meetings, reflecting the directions received from Leaders, Ministers and Senior Officials;
  - e) providing a focal point for distribution of APEC and HRD Working Group documents to members of the Working Group, including project reports and other HRD Working Group material, as well as dissemination of HRD Working Group products to other APEC fora;
  - f) coordinating communication with the APEC Secretariat and other APEC fora;
  - g) facilitating communication among Networks;
  - h) circulating regular reports to members of the Working Group on the outcome of deliberations by this coordinating mechanism.

The members of this coordinating mechanism could initially include the Lead Shepherd, the Network Coordinators, volunteers from member economies and the APEC Secretariat.

#### Conclusion of Discussion

79. The Lead Shepherd concluded the discussion by commending participants for their excellent suggestions in response to the questions which had been posed to them.

#### PROCEDURAL MATTERS: DATE AND VENUE FOR NEXT MEETING

80. Brunei Darussalam provided details on its plan to host the 14th HRD Working Group meeting on June 23-27, 1996. In response to questions about the proximity of the HRD 14 date to the BAC meeting (likely the third week of July), it was agreed that the proposed date should be discussed among Brunei Darussalam, the Lead Shepherd, and the APEC Secretariat.
81. Australia indicated that HRD 15 would be held in Sydney January 20-23, 1997.

#### CLOSING REMARKS

82. The Lead Shepherd thanked the member economies, the members of the New Zealand Secretariat and the Host for their contributions to such a successful meeting.
83. The Host thanked the many New Zealand organizations who had supported the meeting.
84. The New Zealand delegation officially closed the HRD Working Group meeting by singing a Maori song of farewell.