

Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation

2006/SOM1/CTI/FTA-RTA/010a

Services Liberalization by APEC Member Economies (Presentation)

Submitted by: Sherry Stephenson, PECC Trade Forum



APEC Workshop on Best Practices in Trade Policy for RTAs/FTAs: Practical Lessons and Experiences for Developing Economies Ha Noi, Viet Nam 27 February-1 March 2006

Services Liberalization by **APEC Member Economies**

> Dr. Sherry M. Stephenson PECC Trade Forum

APEC Workshop "Best Practices in RTAs"

Ha Noi, Vietnam, 27-28 February 2006

OBJECTIVE OF STUDY

To evaluate extent of progress in services liberalization by APEC **Economics towards** meeting the Bogor Goals

METHODOLOGY OF STUDY

Necessary to determine

- choice of sectors
- sources of information
- years of examination - typology of restrictions
- modes of supply
- Set out in Annex I on Definitions, Sources and Methodology

CHOICE OF SERVICE SECTORS

Three sectors chosen for examination

- representative sample of interest for both developed and developing APEC economies
- 1. Telecommunications
- 2. Construction/ Related Engineering Services
- 3. Distribution

SOURCES OF INFORMATION

Four data sources chosen

- to provide as complete a set of information as possible on APEC economies
- 1. WTO Schedules of Commitments
- 2. WTO Trade Policy Reviews
- 3. APEC Individual Action Plans
- 4. Annexes to Regional Trade Agreements

YEARS OF EXAMINATION

Dependent upon data source

- with goal of reviewing most recent and up-to-date information possible from various fora (multilateral and regional)
- WTO Schedules of Commitments 1994 Schedules; 1997 for Telecom Protocol IV
 WTO Trade Policy Reviews all reports between 1999 2005
- 3.
- Detween 1999 2005 APEC Individual Action Plans all IAPS between 2001 to 2004 Annexes to Regional Trade Agreements year of agreement 4.

TYPOLOGY OF RESTRICTIONS

Adapted from WTO GATS Agreement and studies by other multilateral/ regional institutions - necessary to simplify somewhat to bring study within manageable proportions

MARKET ACCESS NATIONAL TREATMENT 4 categories 2 categories

TYPOLOGY OF RESTRICTIONS

MARKET ACCESS

- 1. Restriction on foreign ownership 2. Restriction on entrance (licenses, QRs)
- 3. Restriction on competition
- 4. Restriction on type of legal entity

NATIONAL TREATMENT

- 1. Restriction on nationality/ residence
- 2. Any other type of national treatment restriction

MODES OF SERVICE SUPPLY

- THREE OF FOUR MODES EXAMINED, IN TWO CATEGORIES
 - 1. CROSS-BORDER TRADE
 - (Modes 1 and 2 under WTO GATS) 2. COMMERCIAL PRESENCE
 - (Mode 3 under WTO GATS)
- Note: Mode 4 not taken into consideration, as not enough information available in WTO Schedules and often excluded from RTAs

TYPOLOGY OF RESTRICTIONS

Three types of entries in order to standardize all sources of information in the tables:

- LIBERALIZED = no restrictions in place (green)
- PARTIALLY LIBERALIZED = some type of restriction in place, without judging degree of restrictiveness (yellow) Þ
- NOT LISTED or NO COMMITMENT = no information provided on the sector (red) ×

CHALLENGES OF RESEARCH

- ۶
- ×
- NATURE OF RESTRICTIONS TO SERVICES TRADE REGULATORY MEASURES DIFFICULTY OF QUANTIFYING RESTRICTIVE IMPACT OF EXISTING MEASURES, ONCE IDENTIFIED VOLUME OF INFORMATION TO EXAMINE -
- 295 pages of summary tables alone DEVELOPING A CONSISTENT APPROACH ACROSS SOURCES IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO COMPARE THEM >
- HOW TO DEAL WITH HORIZONTAL MEASURES IN THE ANALYSIS ×

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS OF STUDY

State of Liberalization of APEC Economies in the Services Area far from Bogor Goals ۶

GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

THERE IS STILL A GREAT DEAL TO BE DONE; SERVICES LIBERALIZATION IS FAR FROM ACHIEVED IN APEC; MANY RESTRICTIONS REMAIN; INFORMATION FOR COMPREHENSIVE ASSESSMENT IS INCOMPLETE; RTAS HAVE GONE MUCH FURTHER

I. EXAMINING WTO SERVICES COMMITMENTS BY APEC ECONOMIES

Summary of Existing Restrictions on Services as set out in Schedules of Commitments for 18 APEC Economies – WTO Members

1. Telecommunications

- 2. Construction /Related Engineering Services
- 3. Distribution

Telecommunications Services (1)



Telecommunications Services (2)

		Cross-Border	Commercial Presence	Liberalized
	Fixed Line			Partially Liberalized
Mexico	Mobile Network			No Commitment / Not listed
	Value-added Telecom Services			 Detailed information available in T
	Fixed Line			
New Zealand	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Foxed Line			
Papua New Guinea	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Fixed Line			
Peru	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Foxed Line			
Philippines	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Fixed Line			
Singapore	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Foxed Line			
Chinese Taipel	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Fixed Line			
Thailand	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Foxed Line			
United States	Mobile Network			
	Value-added Telecom Services			

Construction and Related Engineering Services

	Cross-Bolder	Commercial Presence	1	- Received
Assistin				Fadaly Linesland
Eronal Darossalam				 Detailer tetewatter grafakter
Canada				
Chile				
China				
Kang Kong, China				
Indonesia				
Japan				
Korea, Rep. of				
Malaysia				
Manhor				
New Zealand				
Papua New Guinea				
Para				
Philippinan				
Lingapore				
Chinese Talpei				
Theliand				

16

Distribution Services (1)



Distribution Services (2)

		Cross-Border	Commercial Presence	Liberalized
	Wholesale Trade Services			Partially Liberariped
Mealco	Retailing Services			No Commitment / Not listed
	Franchising			× Detailed information available in Tail
	Wholesale Trade Services			
New Zealand	Retailing Services			
	Franchising			
	Wholesale Trade Services			
Papua New Guinea	Retailing Services			
	Franchising Wholesale Trade Services			
Peru	Retailing Services Franchising			
	- candisang Mitolasala Trada Geourse			
Philippines	Retailing Services			
	Franchising Wholesale Trade Services			
Singapore	Retailing Services			
	Franchising			
Chinese Taipei	Retailing Services			
	Franchising			
	Wholesale Trade Services			
Thailand	Retailing Services			
	Franchising			
	Wholesale Trade Services			
United States	Retailing Services			
	Franchising			

Comments on GATS Commitments

- More commitments in telecom sector than any other, and more recent; EVEN SO >
- 1. Sectoral and modal coverage uneven by APEC Members
 2. Information incomplete several

- missing commitments3. Liberalization incomplete : 27% of telecom sector liberalized; 16% construction sector liberalized; 26% distribution sector liberalized

II. EXAMINING WTO TRADE POLICY **REVIEWS FOR APEC ECONOMIES**

- Summary of Information available in WTO Trade Policy Reviews between 1999-2005 for 17 APEC Economies
 - 1. Information on Telecom Sector for 17 Economies
 - 2. Information on Construction/Engineering for 2 Economies
 - 3. Information on Distribution for 1 Economy

Telecommunications Services (1)



Telecommunications Services (2)

		Orres-Bonter	Commercial Presence	- band not
	Davic Talectory Services	11000-001041	COmmittee Presence	
Maxico	Assic Telecom Services Mobile Telecom Services			Partially Liberalized No Controllment / Not Entert
MEXICO	Value-added Telecom Services			 Detailed information available in table
	Value-acced releccht services			X Detailed intomation available in table
New Zealand	Make Leecon Services			
New Zesand	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Dasic Talacter Services			
Barran Marco Codenas	Mobile Telecom Services			
rapus new during	Jokum resources Services			
	Dasic Talacter Services			
Den	Noble Telecom Services			
	Jokum resources Services			
	Desir Talacom Services			
Philippines	Mobile Telecom Services			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Rasic Telecom Services			
Singapore	Noble Telecom Services			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Rasic Telecom Services			
Chinese Taipel	Noble Telecom Services			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Rasic Telecom Services			
Thaland	Noble Telecom Services			
	Value-added Telecom Services			
	Rasic Telecom Services			
United States	Noble Telecom Services			

23

Comments on Trade Policy Reviews

- Studies are infrequent; only one review per APEC economy (other than PNG, Peru and United States) for past six years ۶
- Minor part of TPRs devoted to services no in-depth coverage
 Information only available for telecom but not for construction/engineering or distribution
 Description of measures are very general; difficult to make coincide with other sources

- 4. Telecom liberalization incomplete :
 - 19% of telecom sector liberalized

23

III. EXAMINING APEC INDIVIDUAL ACTION PLANS (IAPs)

- Summary of Information available in APEC Individual Action Plans between 2000/2001 and 2004 or most recent year for 18 APEC Economies
 - 1. Information on Telecom Sector for 18
 - Economies 2. Information on Construction/Engineering for
 - 16 Economies
 - 3. Information on Distribution for 18 Economies

Telecommunications Services

			Commerce/Presence	
Australia	State famous (annual			Campbolic American
				 Deleted atom store gradults & Table U.
Canada	Value at Not Talkiam Second			
Chile	Value solded Selected Department			
	Name Takanak Lantan			
China				
Rong Kong, Child				
Indon-wore				
Apen				
Korea, Kep. of				
Marine				
New Judwell				
Passa Res Contes				
Para				
Philippines				
	Name added Taxante Gamman			
Transvers	Busis Talacon Landon			
Chinese Takeni				
	States and at Taxanth Second			
Thefford				
Rained Status				
Vet Bats	Wards Talaccele Earliers			

Construction and Related Engineering Services



Distribution Services



Comments on APEC IAPs

Available in electronic form since 2000 but four APEC Economies have not submitted any IAPs ×

1. Gaps in IAP coverage for years and sectors 2

- No information provided on cross-border trade (modes 1 and 2); only on commercial presence (mode 3)
- (mode 1 and 2); only on commercial presence (mode 3) 3. Comparison with other sources difficult as description of measures is very general no classification numbers 4. Information not updated very very: little changes between 2000 and 2004 in majority of IAPs that tend to repeat WTO GATS commitments 4. Uberalization incomplete : 1989 of telegome center liberalized.

28

Liberalization incomplete : 18% of telecom sector liberalized; 13% construction sector liberalized; 14% distribution sector liberalized

IV. EXAMINING REGIONAL TRADE AGREEMENTS (RTAs)

- Summary of Information available in Annexes to Regional Trade Agreements (RTAs) among APEC Member Economies
- Member Leoning Restrictions on Services as set out in the Lists of Non-Conforming Measures (i.e. those measures that do not comply with the core disciplines of the agreement, namely to liberalize MFN, national treatment, market access, cross-border supply)

29

11 REGIONAL TRADE AGREEMENTS examined involving APEC ECONOMIES

- RTAs adopting a "negative list" approach examined ANZCERTA :Australia-New Zoaland 1989 1999 annex NAFTA: Canada-Maxico-USA 1994 FTA: Canada Scingapore 2001 FTA: CIBI Mexico 1999 CEP: New Zoaland Singapore 2001 FTA: USA Chile 2004 FTA: USA Chile 2004 FTA: USA Chile 2004 FTA: USA Australia 2005 EPA: Japan Maxico 2005 EPA: Brunel-Chile-NZ-Singapore 2006

inications Services: Without Horizontal Telecom Reservations

TOTATION OF ALL PROPERTY.	
Cohords of New Textury	
Austria, Ass. Astar.	
Coloria - Chile	
Salada - 65m	
COR STATES	
Transferd . Linesson	
tax Lealand 5 massion	
White State Chin	
ORNAG STATES - Chille	
Inches Diales - Lingagoria	
Includ Linds . Linguance	
Columbule of Colors Plates	
Lobertolic of Jacobs	
Chiefe A Anna	
COLUMN TYPE	
Links Jacks 511	

Construction and Related Engineering Services: Without Horizontal Reservations



Distribution Services: Without Horizontal Reservations

Stratus of Sciences	Database database	
	Designation in a designed	
Substate - New Journal -		
Catalan - Colle	A STRUCTURE DE RESERT	
	TERMINA SERVICE	
Saddie of Dide	Designation designed	
	Company to a set	
	WATTER TWO DOLLARS	
hadde of head (a pland		
	CRIMENT OF LODGE	
	Warbigs Tiple Lobiet	
	P-B Tel De B Col	
	Table baller	
Total Area of Date	1 100-00 10 10 http://	
	A statistics for any	
that Mater. Lingshow.		
	Destantine Security	
Range Ray of China Str. Dr.		
	TANK-Statester	
5000 Att. 6. 100		
code links - Authols.		
Contraction of Contract		
Life for all Marries		
Contract of the second	Deskelor frager	
Tana Faster 18.5	Derivative designer	
Lot a risk of the station of		
Trate Party 18.9	CONSCION DOUBLES	
Tiple Parks 157	Database beaters	

Telecommunications Services: With Horizontal

	Commercial Presence	Characteriation of Characteria
Australia New Zealand		A s Camm (im and / Nat Inlas
Anninglin - New Jacines		
Australia - New Zealand		
Schedule of Singapore		
United States . Chile		
United States - Chile		
Alled Atalan - Alexandra		
Karns, Res. of Chils		
Units States - Australia		
deserve Manine		
Laboration of Chile		
Lease Paulle ALC		
		alam. Chile. New Zealand and Singapore

Construction and Related Engineering Services: With Horizontal Reservations



Distribution Services: With Horizontal Reservations



Comments on APEC RTAs

- Annexes of most RTAs examined quite recent
- 1. RTAs under the "negative list" approach require comprehensive sectoral coverage as well as complete information on all outstanding restrictions (or "nonconforming measures")
- 2. These RTAs thus provide greater transparency and greater information than other service agreements
- 3. Two types of non-conforming measures: sector-specific and horizontal; difficulty is in dealing with the horizontal measures, to determine their impact.
- 4. Liberalization under RTAs has gone further than under WTO or APEC IAPs but is still incomplete.

Services Liberalization under RTAs

- > Taking into account Horizontal Measures:
- TELECOM 33 % telecom sector liberalized
- CONSTRUCTION/ ENG 45 % sector liberalized
 DISTRIBUTION 40 % distribution sector liberalized
- > With only Sectoral Measures:
- TELECOM 64 % telecom sector liberalized
- CONSTRUCTION/ ENG 88 % construction sector liberalized
- DISTRIBUTION 84 % distribution sector liberalized

NOTE: IN BOTH CASES, LIBERALIZATION MORE ADVANCED

WHERE HAS SERVICES LIBERALIZATION GONE FURTHER – in APEC?

- Have any APEC Members gone beyond WTO GATS commitments in their APEC IAPs?
- TELECOM : One economy has gone further (Singapore); but 5 economies have provided more information in WTO context (Korea, Malaysia, New Zealand, Chinese Taipei, United States)
- CONSTRUCTION/ ENGINEERING SERVICES: Three economies have gone further (Chile: Peru; Singapore) but 5 economies have provided more information/ liberalization in WTO context (Canada, Japan, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, United States)
- DISTRIBUTION SERVICES Five economies have provided more information in APEC IAPS (Chile, Indonesia, Malaysia, Mexico, Philippines), but 7 economies have provided more information/ liberalization in WTO context (Australia, PRChina, Japan, Korea, Chinese Taipe), Thaliand, United States)

WHERE HAS SERVICES LIBERALIZATION GONE FURTHER – in RTAs?

Have any APEC Members gone beyond WTO liberalization in their RTAs?

TELECOM : Yes – members of 7 RTAs have gone further in liberalization

CONSTRUCTION/ ENGINEERING SERVICES : Yes – members of 7 RTAs have gone further in liberalization

DISTRIBUTION SERVICES: Yes – members of 8 RTAs have gone further in liberalization

Conclusions

- Services liberalization in APEC still has a long ways to go.
- APEC Members are not close to meeting the Bogor Goals.
- Information provided on services liberalization in the APEC context is often not as complete as that in the WTO or in RTAs.
- The regional forum or RTAS have produced greater liberalization of services to date by APEC Members through "negative list" RTAS, however membership of these RTAs is limited and there is no obligation to extend this treatment to other economies.

41