

**Summary Report**  
**1st APEC Counter-Terrorism Working Group (CTWG) Meeting**  
*22-23 February, 2014, Ningbo-China*

**Executive Summary**

1. During the first CTWG meeting in Ningbo, China (SOM1) members endorsed the CTWG Workplan for 2014 and introduced minor adjustments to the CTWG Strategic plan 2013-2017.
2. Members welcomed the Counter Terrorism Action Plan (CTAP) Summary Report 2013 presented by the Secretariat which shows capacity building gaps and opportunities of APEC economies related to counter-terrorism. Members agreed to share statistical information of the report with other APEC subfora with cross-cutting issues such as the TPTWG, TWG and others. Members were encouraged to submit their 2014 CTAPs updates by October 1st 2014.
3. Members welcomed reports by the CTWG Chair and the Secretariat on intersessional work and activities undertaken after the last meeting held in Medan in 2013. The reports highlighted the upgrade from task force to a working group; the SCE endorsement of the CTWG terms of reference (ToR) and the CTTF Independent assessment; as well as project management issues.
4. The Secretariat briefed members on the IT platform, Remote Participation System, which is under development. Members expressed strong interest in this IT tool, particularly Canada who is leading the development of a Major Events Security Framework (MESF) for use across APEC. .
5. Members agreed to merge into one single event the upcoming STAR IX Conference with the Russian initiative to hold a thematic discussion on Container Transportation Security. The joint event will be held on the margins of the SOM3 in Beijing, in August 2014 (TBA).
6. Members welcomed reports on completed and new projects that implement the Work Plan and the APEC Counter-Terrorism and Secure Trade (CT-ST) Strategy.
  - Under Secure Supply Chain the U.S. briefed on the joint CTWG/TPTWG/SCCP Trade Recovery Project, which will have financial support from USAID.
  - Under Secure Travel the U.S. updated on its proposal for follow on bus security training to be held in the Philippines in 2014 (TBA).
  - Under Secure Finance, the U.S. presented a new project on 'Secure Finance Workshop on Countering the Financing of Terrorism with New Payment Systems', to be held in spring 2014 (TBA).
  - Under Secure Infrastructure the U.S. presented a new project on 'Critical Infrastructure Security and Resilience', also to be held in spring 2014 (TBA).
7. The next CTWG Meeting in 2014 will be held in the margins of SOM2 in Qingdao, in May 2014 (TBA).

**Summary Report**  
**1st APEC Counter-Terrorism Working Group (CTWG) Meeting**  
*22-23 February, 2014, Ningbo-China*

The 1st APEC Counter-Terrorism Working Group (CTWG) meeting was held in Ningbo-China on 22-23 February, 2014 on the margins of SOM1. The meeting was chaired by Ambassador Harry Purwanto (Indonesia) and sixteen member economies participated (all except Hong Kong China, Japan, Mexico, New Zealand and Thailand).

**OPENING REMARKS; ADOPTION OF THE MEETING AGENDA AND REPORT ON INTERSESSIONAL ACTIVITIES**

**CTWG Chair** welcomed members to the first meeting under the new format of an official APEC working group, expressing his gratitude to the government of the People's Republic of China for their great hospitality and arrangements for the meeting. He remarked that creating a secure environment for economies is vital to ensure growth and prosperity, and that there is still a need to enhance capacity building for protecting the Asia Pacific's economic system from disruption. This approach is also aligned with the statement of the APEC Ministers in 2013, which underlined the importance of members work on counter terrorism to secure supply chains, finance, travel, and infrastructure in the APEC region.

The Chair expressed satisfaction with the SCE's endorsement for upgrading the Counter Terrorism Task Force into a working group, which was also supported by the APEC Ministers in their 2013 declaration. He also highlighted the SCE's approval of the CTTF's response to the recommendations provided in the final report of the 2012 CTTF Independent Assessment.

The Chair remarked that the transformation of the task force into a working group, which provides a five year mandate, reflects our commitment to long-term work and to energize our efforts in continuing the CT mission, such as building capacity in the region to mitigate, prepare for, and respond appropriately to the threats posed by terrorism. The CTWG mission also includes fostering private-public partnerships (PPP) and enhancing business resilience as well as minimizing the risks of disruptions to the Asia-Pacific economy.

The Chair highlighted two tools available for CTWG that can help to enhance our capacity buildings efforts and our ability to face our capacity building challenges, and specifically, the project evaluation template approved last year and the Counter Terrorism Action Plan (CTAPs) report which identifies capacity needs and opportunities in the areas of counterterrorism among APEC economies.

The Chair encouraged members to come up with more new technical assistance programs and capacity building initiatives, which he considers a process which never stops, as there is a continuous need to update skills for new people who become engaged in counterterrorism work, as well as for the people who are already involved, and because terrorism threats are essentially dynamic, always taking new forms and using new techniques and strategies.

The Chair pointed out that the CTWG mandate extension from two to five years will provide the chance to adopt long-term plans in a more sustainable way, following the three main pillars of the Consolidated Counterterrorism and Secure Trade (CT/ST) Strategy, namely Security, Efficiency and Resilience. The Chair thanked all members and the Secretariat Program Director (PD) for the intersessional work and inputs to facilitate smooth interaction and recent relevant achievements.

**Members** endorsed the draft annotated agenda for the 1st CTWG meeting.

The Chair reported on his intersessional activities and international interactions following the last meeting in Medan, Indonesia. Beside the intersessional work reflected in relevant documents submitted to the meeting, he highlighted two activities in his capacity as Chair, first, his attendance at the SCE meeting in Medan in July 2013, where he presented the proposal to upgrade the task force to a working group, and second his attendance at the High-Level Policy Dialogue on Travel Facilitation held in Bali on 1-2 October 2013.

## CTTF-CTWG ACHIEVEMENTS DURING 2013.

**Indonesia** presented a review of the CTTF-CTWG achievements in 2013 during Indonesia's APEC host year. Indonesia highlighted the work conducted by CTTF which included, implementing and monitoring the APEC Leaders' commitments related to the Consolidated CT/ST Strategy, which includes CTTF cross-fora collaboration with TPTWG, SCCP, BMG, TWG, and TELWG, and others. He also highlighted the organization of the three CTTF meetings conducted in Jakarta, Surabaya and Medan. In 2013, the CTTF also drafted and endorsed a Strategic Plan for 2013-2017, and achieved and upgrade to the status of working group. The group also submitted the new CTWG Terms of Reference (ToR), which was endorsed by the SCE in November. Finally, Indonesia highlighted several past CTTF projects, workshops, and the policy dialogue conducted during in 2013.

## APEC SECRETARIAT BUSINESS

The APEC Secretariat (PD) reported on project management issues, ongoing tasks and APEC developments, and the coordinated work done intersessionally related to the process of transforming the task force into a working group, and the drafting of new ToR.

## CHINA 2014 PRIORITIES

A representative of the SOM I Chair's office from **P.R. China** briefed on APEC 2014 Priorities.

China proposed to conduct the APEC work during 2014 under the theme "*Shaping the Future through Asia Pacific Partnership*" to allow member economies to join efforts in fostering a forward looking Asia-Pacific partnership that would continue to empower APEC to lead and coordinate global economic recovery. In order to support such efforts, China has identified three priority areas:

1. Advancing Regional Economic Integration; with the view that APEC members work to embark on the Free Trade Area in Asia Pacific (FTAAP) process, promote investment cooperation, and enhance information sharing through? Free Trade Agreements (FTAs).
2. Promoting Innovative Development, Economic Reform and Growth. The purpose of practical cooperation under this priority area is to explore new areas of growth through innovation and reform that foster an open economy. Practical areas of cooperation are: economic structural reform, financing, taxation, green economy, innovative growth, sustainable energy and resources, blue economy, internet economy, urbanization, cross-border e-commerce, food security, mining, and forestry.
3. Strengthening Comprehensive Connectivity and Infrastructure Development. Cooperation efforts will focus on promoting hardware, software, and people to people connectivity. Plans include among others, the development of a Asia-Pacific Connectivity Blueprint; exploring the expansion of financing channels for infrastructure development; strengthening regional fiscal and financial cooperation, facilitating cross-border education; and establishing all-directional, multi-tiered and comprehensive connectivity structure across Asia Pacific.

## CTWG WORK PLAN 2014 and CTWG STRATEGIC PLAN

**The CTWG** members discussed and endorsed the CTWG Work Plan 2014 proposed by the Chair.

**The CTWG Chair** invited members to discuss and to propose adjustments to the CTTF/CTWG Strategic Plan 2013 -2017 endorsed by members during the last CTTF meeting in Medan, which is considered a 'living document'. Members gave some suggestions and introduced minor adjustments to the document, such as updating the name of the group by replacing 'task force' with 'working group'. The U.S. suggested updating the plan to reflect completed activities. **Australia** suggested members consider developing multi-year projects and to reflect these in the strategic plan, especially considering the new long term mandate of the working group.

## COUNTER-TERRORISM ACTION PLAN (CTAP)

**The Secretariat** presented the 2013 CTAP Summary Report, which prioritized economies 'capacity building gaps and opportunities related to counterterrorism.

In 2013, the Secretariat received nine CTAP updates from: Canada; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Japan; Mexico; Russia; Singapore; Thailand and United States (CTAP are available in the MDDB of the APEC web page). Members were encouraged to complete and submit their reports regularly, in order to maintain the integrity of the CTAP process. In 2013, economies completed an additional table proposed by the Secretariat that included options in five specific categories of capacity building activities, which allowed for narrative-styled information to be presented as data that helped to build up the charts in the report.

Results show in general more opportunities than gaps: a total of 192 vs 54, especially in section A1 'Protect Cargo'. The report's findings showed that Piracy & Maritime security has been chosen by economies as the priority number one for capacity gaps for three consecutive years.

Members agreed to share the report data with other APEC subfora with cross-cutting issues. **Canada** suggested to create a specific template for this purpose. Based on this **Australia** suggested creating a CTAP fact-sheet to share with other APEC groups. **The Russian Federation** remarked that CTAP is regarded as an important part of its practical work that shows advances in its internal counter-terrorism legislation and thanked the Secretariat for facilitating the reporting process. **The Russian Federation** provided an update on changes in its national Counter Terrorism legislation.

**Indonesia** briefed members on internal efforts, legal initiatives and activities aimed at preventing terrorism financing. **Canada** briefed on recent developments related to its national counter terrorism strategy (the details of which can be seen in Canada's CTAP update 2013). **China** briefed on internal talks regarding the financing of terrorism and announced that it expects to submit its CTAP update soon this year. **Papua New Guinea** shared a report on its counter terrorism activities and announced that its CTAP update which will be submitted shortly.

**The Philippines** also shared a report on national initiatives and measures against money laundering and finance terrorism. **Chile** gave an update on national efforts to prevent terrorism, particularly to implement internationally coordinated measures against terrorist financing as well as its formation of border counterterrorism teams. It also reported on bilateral capacity building efforts with Argentina on illicit trafficking of nuclear and hazardous materials. **Viet Nam** briefed on recent developments under its national counterterrorism framework, as well as international conventions and workshops on counter terrorism, which took place in Viet Nam during 2013. **Korea** briefed on national efforts to prevent terrorism particularly in cyberspace, including the organization of a conference on this matter in during 2013.

**The CTWG Chair and members** acknowledged the importance of regular CTAP reporting and the value of the Summary Report for guiding the group's efforts in capacity building activities. Members were encouraged to submit their 2014 CTAPs updates by October 1st 2014.

#### **IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CTWG WORK PLAN AND THE APEC COUNTER-TERRORISM AND SECURE TRADE STRATEGY'S CROSS-CUTTING ACTIVITY AREAS**

The CTWG Chair invited members to provide updates on projects and activities proposed for 2014. Members welcomed reports on completed and new projects on implementation of the Work Plan and the APEC Counter-Terrorism and Secure Trade Strategy (CT-ST).

1. Under Secure Supply Chain, **the United States** briefed on the joint CTWG/TPTWG/SCCP APEC Trade Recovery Communication Mechanism Project. The U.S. reported that this project will have financial support from USAID to create the Global Trade Recovery Information Platform System in cooperation with the World Customs Organisation (WCO), and that a concept note will be submitted to USAID to co-fund with APEC a number of good practices' workshops for using the system. The U.S. also reported on recent Maritime Expert Group Security (MEG-SEC) activities on Port Security in collaboration with the International Maritime Organization.

**The Russian Federation** reported on its proposal to hold a thematic discussion on Container Transportation Security, co-sponsored by Indonesia and China. Russia agreed to combine this activity with the Secure Trade in the Asia-Pacific Region (STAR) conference to be held in 2014 conjunction with the CTWG meeting at SOM 3.

2. Under Secure Travel, **the United States** updated on the joint BMG/CTTF/SCCP projects to Develop Trusted Traveler Characteristics and the project to Develop Best Practices on Implementing Advance Passenger Information Systems (API) led by BMG under the Travel Facilitation Initiative (TFI). Under the first project, the U.S. recently presented the BMG with the results of the questionnaire, and once approved the U.S. will then suggest workshops to the CTWG and SCCP. Regarding the APIS project, the BMG approved and responded to the budget questionnaire and reviewed the responses from economies. The U.S. is drafting a lessons learned document based on the responses and plans to submit it at the upcoming BMG meeting. Once approved the document will be shared with the CTWG and other relevant working groups.

**The United States** also updated on its proposal for follow on bus security training to be held in the Philippines in 2014 (TBA).

**Indonesia** reported on the outcomes from the High Level Policy Dialogue on Travel Facilitation held in Bali on 1-2 October 2013, led by the APEC Tourism Working Group (TWG). The dialogue was attended by high level government officials from APEC economies responsible for travel facilitation, tourism, transportation, immigration and custom, as well as participants from international organization including the UNWTO, WTTC, PATA and IATA. The Joint ministerial Statement of the dialogue can be found in the following link: [http://www.apec.org/Meeting-Papers/Ministerial-Statements/High-Level-Policy-Dialogue/2013\\_travel.aspx](http://www.apec.org/Meeting-Papers/Ministerial-Statements/High-Level-Policy-Dialogue/2013_travel.aspx)

**The Russian Federation** reported on current threats in the sphere of transport security and relevant changes in its national legislation.

3. Under Secure Finance, **the United States** presented a new self-funded project on 'Secure Finance Workshop on Countering the Financing of Terrorism with New Payment Systems', to be held in spring 2014 (TBA). The U.S. remarked that it is seeking a host economy for this workshop.

**Australia** reported on the self-funded project 'Designated Non-Financial Businesses and Professions (DNFBPs)'. Refer to meeting documents 2014/SOM1/CTWG/018 'Draft Report', and 2014/SOM1/CTWG/019 'Summary Report'.

**The Russian Federation** updated on the central initiative of its Presidency in the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) – to detect and block illicit financial flows linked to the production and trafficking of Afghan drugs. Russia reiterated that the purpose of this project is to get data on financial flows resulting from drug trafficking through identifying bank transactions, front companies and beneficiaries of money transfers. Russia encouraged APEC member economies to contribute relevant information to the report, the final version of which will be presented by the end of the Russian Presidency in the FATF in June 2014.

**The United States** presented its project on the 'Secure Finance Workshop on Countering the Financing of Terrorism with new Payment Systems'. The workshop aims to raise APEC economies awareness to the challenges and threats posed by National Payment Systems (NPS) in financing terrorism, as they are largely unregulated. The workshop will be held in summer or early fall, 2014.

4. Under Secure Infrastructure, **Canada** reported on the APEC-funded project on Major Events Security Planning, particularly on the outcomes of the two 'Major Events Security Framework Workshops (MESF) under this project. The first one was held on 10-12 June 2013 in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, and the second was held on 28-30 October 2013 in Santiago, Chile. Canada will upload MESF materials onto the new web site that the Secretariat created specifically for this framework. **Chile** expressed its gratitude to Canada for the MESF workshop held in

Santiago, highlighting lessons learned and best practices, and the opportunity for Chilean officials to share their experiences in this area. **Singapore** also expressed its appreciation to Canada for the excellent work and results of both workshops which also allows for the development of a regional major events security network.

**The United States** presented a new self-funded project on 'Critical Infrastructure Security and Resilience' to be held in spring 2014 (TBA). The initiative aims to implement the ideas from and continue the dialogue started at the CTF Policy Dialogue on Secure Infrastructure in the Asia Pacific Region held in Medan in June 2013. The U.S. thanked Indonesia, Canada the Philippines, Australia and Russia for their support and for contributing their expertise to the dialogue. The proposed workshop also aims to engage APEC experts in developing a common framework for cooperating to enhance secure and resilient infrastructure. The U.S. is also seeking a host economy for this workshop.

**Russia** expressed its appreciation of the positive results of the Policy Dialogue on Secure Infrastructure held in Medan and showed its interest to continue to keep this important issue in the focus of CTWG, including by sharing national experiences and best practices.

### SECURE TRADE IN APEC REGION (STAR) CONFERENCE

Members received an update from **Indonesia** on preparations for the STAR IX Conference to be held in 2014 by SOM3, hosted by China, which will be co-sponsored by Indonesia and Russia. Indonesia plans to send out a paper on the content and sections for the Conference for members' inputs, and expects that the paper will be discussed and approved at the upcoming CTWG meeting in Qingdao at SOM2.

For practical considerations and to increase private sector engagement. Members adopted the decision of Indonesia, China and Russia to merge into one single event the upcoming STAR IX Conference with Russia's proposal to hold a thematic discussion on Container Transportation Security. The two-day long STAR IX Conference will be held on the margins of the SOM3 in Beijing, in August 2014 (TBA). The first day of the conference will focus on presentations from member economies, multilateral organizations and ABAC representatives, while the second day will focus on Container Transportation Security.

**Australia** and **the U.S.** expressed their appreciation to members for their efforts in preparing the STAR conference and expressed their willingness to contribute to Indonesia's proposal for the conference contents. **China** reiterated its commitment to co-sponsor and host the STAR conference, and also highlighted the importance of engaging the private sector at this conference. **Russia** reported on its preparations for the thematic discussion of Container Transportation Security.

### OTHER MATTERS

**The Secretariat** reported on the development of new useful tools to enhance participation in meetings which can be suitable for CTWG members' future work. As some delegates face limited opportunities to travel to APEC meetings given time and cost considerations, remote participation offers an alternative way to participate and share expertise. MS Lync is the platform solution for Remote Participation. The Secretariat encouraged CTWG members to consider piloting this system and possibly using it in for future meetings or workshops. Members expressed strong interest in piloting and using this facility once it's ready.

**Australia** proposed to take advantage of the Remote Participation System under development by the Secretariat to help experts participate remotely in the STAR IX Conference. **Canada** also expressed interest in using it to future work on Major Events Security Framework.

**The Chair** shared the Tourism Working Group (TWG) leader's interest in participating as a guest at upcoming CTWG meetings to explore cross-fora collaboration on issues under the Travel Facilitation Initiative (TFI). The TFI involves CTWG, TWG, TPTWG and BMG.

**The Chair** reminded members that his term as CTWG Chair will end this year. Considering that the last meeting of the year will be held in August, he encouraged members to consider stepping forward as

candidate for Chair for the period 2015-2016. He also reminded the group that the position of Vice Chair still remains vacant and encouraged members to volunteer for this position in order to help the group's ongoing and future work.

#### **NEXT MEETING**

The next CTWG Meeting in 2014 will be held in the margins of SOM2 in Qingdao, in May 2014 (TBA).

#### **CLOSING REMARKS**

The CTWG Chair shared his closing remarks expressing his satisfaction with the work done, the contributions received, and discussions conducted during the CTWG's first meeting as a working group. He welcomed the new initiatives presented by members, and highlighted the adoption and endorsement of important documents which will guide the group's work for the remainder of the year, as well as the decisions adopted on deadlines and intersessional interactions. He expressed his sincere gratitude to all members for their contributions to the meeting and for their commitments to promote counter terrorism work within the CTWG in the interest of prosperity and more secure societies for the people of the Asia-Pacific region. Finally, he expressed his sincere gratitude to P.R. China for hosting and facilitating the CTWG meeting and for its remarkable hospitality.