

**The 36th APEC Human Resources Development Working Group (HRDWG) Meeting
18-21 February 2014
Ningbo, People's Republic of China**

SUMMARY REPORT

PLENARY OPENING SESSION

18 February 2014 [14:30-18:20]

1. The Chair, HRDWG Lead Shepherd (LS), Dr. YoungHwan Kim expressed appreciation to the host economy and introduced Mr. Hao Bin, Director General, Department of International Cooperation of Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security, China, the co-chair. The LS and the Co-Chair welcomed participating delegates from 16 economies: Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, People's Republic of China, Indonesia, Japan, Republic of Korea, Papua New Guinea, Peru, The Philippines, Russia, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, The United States and Viet Nam.
2. The LS introduced the Network Coordinators: Mr. Tsai, Meng-Liang (CBN), Dr. Kuei-Yen Liao (CBN Deputy Coordinator), Ms. Adriana de Kanter (EDNET) and Mr. Malcolm Greening (LSPN), Ms. Grace T. Cruz-Fabella, Program Director and Mr. David Hendrickson, Media Manager from the APEC Secretariat, and invited Mr. David Dodwell, Executive Director of The Hong Kong-APEC Trade Policy Study Group Limited representing ABAC.
3. Mr. David Hendrickson from the APEC Secretariat provided the Newcomers' Orientation.
4. LS introduced HRDWG with the Coordinators, briefing roles and responsibilities of the three networks and important actions in this year, such as the HRD Ministerial Meeting and the Independent Assessment (IA).
5. After receiving a few comments, the LS adopted the agenda and invited Mr. Hao Bin to deliver the opening remarks, highlighting the importance of youth skills development and the theme of APEC 2014: shaping the future through partnership.
6. The LS delivered the welcoming remarks briefing principal activities of HRDWG over the last four years in pursuing the recommendations of IA in 2010. HRDWG initiated intensive and innovative changes and then successfully implemented projects and activities in priority areas. Since 2010, the major issues of HRDWG have been encouraged by the APEC leaders. The LS appreciated the efforts of member economies to change the atmosphere by initiating Cross Border Education (CBE) and People-to-People Connectivity. The Co Chair welcomed the delegates and also briefed the plenary about the thematic dialogue seminar.
7. Ms. Grace T. Cruz-Fabella presented priorities and implications on APEC HRDWG with summarizing directions of the Leaders' Meeting 2013, cross-cutting activities, interactions with other WGs/Fora and required actions for APEC tasking statement for 2014.
8. Dr. Sherri Lauver was invited to deliver the presentation on the upcoming IA with Q&A session. First, however, the LS explained the principal and unique features of HRDWG, which is one of the

largest working groups, responsible for labour and education, dealing with critical and sensitive issues, and should follow up the directions initiated by our ministers at their respective meetings.

9. Mr. David Dodwell updated HRDWG on ABAC's priorities concerning HRD.
10. The network coordinators provided updates from each network. CBN and LSPN announced that they would have a joint session on the second day of the network meeting, continuing preparations for the HRDMM in 2014.
11. The representative of Viet Nam shared updated information on the 6th HRDMM, such as the meeting schedule, theme and sub-themes, side events and the preparatory workshop. In terms of the themes, there was a discussion around building on outcomes from previous ministerial meetings and working group meetings. In particular, some member economies encouraged Viet Nam to promote public-private partnership activities (e.g., the Moscow initiative and North Sumatra Action Plan).
12. The LS and Co-Chair shared the outcomes of the discussion from the Technical Meeting which was convened just before the plenary session. The Co-Chair summarized the first part of the meeting on follow-up activities of the 5th AEMM and preparation for the upcoming 6th HRDMM. The group discussed the Strategic Plan, Annual workplan and terms of reference (TOR), with further feedback to be provided by member economies over the week.
13. The LS encouraged nominations for new leadership of HRDWG and its networks at the technical meeting, after pointing out the guidelines in the TOR that the terms of the Lead Shepherd and the Coordinators are for no more than four years. He encouraged member economies to recommend candidates before the end of this meeting or discuss intersessionally until September 2014.
14. The APEC Secretariat made an updated report on project management.

**The 36th APEC Human Resources Development Working Group (HRDWG) Meeting
18-21 February 2014
Ningbo, People's Republic of China**

SUMMARY REPORT

PLENARY CLOSING SESSION

21 February 2014 [08:30-12:30]

1. The Lead Shepherd (LS) and Mme. Lu Xiaoping, Deputy Director General, Ministry Of Human Resources and Social Security of China jointly chaired the plenary closing session. LS summarized the week of meetings and expressed his appreciation for the successful hosting of the 36th HRDWG Meeting in Ningbo, People's Republic of China.

NETWORK REPORTS

EDNET

2. The EDNET Coordinator, Ms. Adriana De Kanter, chaired the 30th EDNET Meeting with host economy co-chair Mr. Fang Jun.
3. Delegates from 18 Member Economies were present: Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, China, Indonesia, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, New Zealand, Papua New Guinea, Peru, The Philippines, Russia, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, the United States, and Viet Nam.
4. There were two reports from Korea on the priority area of Education Cooperation, discussing the lessons learned from the APEC Education Cooperation Project, including the importance of government action and the need for networks and clear roles of participants, and proposing a project to share online content and scenarios of experiential programs by students.
5. Delegates from China, Japan, Malaysia, Russia, and Thailand presented five reports on the priority area of Mathematics and Science Education and Language and Culture Education, focusing on emergency preparedness, a mathematical problem and assessment database, financial and economic literacy education, learning foreign language to ease business, and understanding best practices based on results of the Program for International Student Assessment (PISA).
6. Australia co-chaired a discussion on updates to the Cross-Border Education Cooperation Workplan and the United States proposed an initiative to promote scholarship information among APEC economies.
7. In addition to the Cross-Border Education Cooperation Workplan, delegates from Australia, China, Indonesia, Russia, Chinese Taipei, and the United States presented eleven reports on the priority area of TVET and Higher Education Quality, including such topics as university associations, a conference on higher education cooperation, establishing the APEC Higher Education Research Center, technical assistance for mobility data collection and usage, expanding membership of APEC members in the Asia-Pacific Higher Education Research Program (APHERP), researcher and

publication collaboration, a student mobility guideline, an academic mobility card, a CTE/TVET alliance and licensing portal, cross-border internship modules, and green skills development in TVET.

8. Delegates from Korea and the United States delivered four reports on the priority area of ICT and Teacher Quality, including the APEC Learning Community for Shared Prosperity (ALCom), a consortium on future education, an e-learning training program, and the collaborative HRDWG Wiki website. In addition, delegates from China, New Zealand, Russia, and the United States delivered a presentation on a cross-economy research project on teacher preparation in mathematics and science and discussed findings from each economy's research.

CBN

9. The Capacity Building Network (CBN) meeting was led by the CBN Coordinator, Mr. Tsai, Meng-Laing, Deputy Coordinator Ms. Liao, Kuei-Yen and the host economy co-chair, Mr. Liu Yutong. Present at the meeting were delegates from 12 member economies from Australia, Brunei Darussalam, People's Republic of China, Indonesia, Japan, Republic of Korea, Papua New Guinea, the Philippines, Peru, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, and Viet Nam.
10. The CBN discussed major issues in this year such as Independent Assessment (IA), HRD Ministerial Meeting, Strategic Plan, Annual Workplan and TOR.
11. The CBN discussed and endorsed project concept notes and gave project reports and project information under four priority areas: A) Strengthening HRM and HRD capacity building for SMEs and entrepreneurs to create job opportunity and facilitate successful trade and investment in APEC, B) Developing competencies standardization and training quality system to promote skills mobility in APEC, C) Promoting skill development and networking training provider in APEC to bridge school to work and enhance labor productivity and D) Narrowing the talent gaps by Industry-VET-Academia Cooperation.
12. Project Concept Notes (CNs) were presented by four economies: Japan, Chinese Taipei, China and Indonesia (2 CNs). Project information was given by Papua New Guinea and Chinese Taipei. Projects reports were presented by Chinese Taipei, Korea, and China.
13. The Philippines confirmed the hosting of the high level Meeting on Human Capacity Building in 2015, in coordination with Papua New Guinea.
14. The CBN and LSPN held a Joint Meeting in the morning of 20 February to discuss the Strategic Themes, objectives, and tasking for the HRDMM6 that will be held in Viet Nam in September 2014. The CBN and LSPN members held Informal roundtable discussions to develop priority themes, sub-themes and broad action items, which would be further developed out-of-session.
15. The CBN returned to its session and discussed nominations for the new CBN Coordinator for 2015-2016 and agreed to wait until September 2014 to formalize the CBN Coordinatorship for 2015-2016, noting the current consensus to support the Coordinatorship of Chinese Taipei for a second term.

LSPN

16. The LSPN meeting was led by the LSPN Coordinator, Mr Malcolm Greening, and the host economy co-chair, Mr Hao Bin. Present at the meeting were delegates from fifteen member economies: Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, China, Indonesia, Japan, Korea, Peru, the Philippines, Russia, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, the US and Viet Nam.
17. LSPN considered an update on how its project activity is tracking against the elements of the APEC HRD Ministers' Action Plan for 2011 to 2014, noting the wide-ranging and comprehensive progress which has been made, with the 2014 HRDMM nearing.
18. Network members presented short updates on labour and social protection developments in their economies. Some of the key themes which emerged included: skills mismatch and investment; demographic challenges; underemployment and the availability of higher skilled jobs; strategies concerning the informal sector; the engagement of youth and women, including their skills and employment; pension reform; partnering the business sector and other bodies (e.g. the Moscow Initiative in 2012 and the North Sumatra Action Plan in 2013); and support for workers in the process of internal or external migration.
19. Member economies thanked Japan for its long-standing contribution to APEC in hosting an annual HRD forum, noting the value of the events in sharing knowledge on a broad range of themes and promoting people-to people connectivity. Similarly, economies noted the contribution which China's APEC skills development project is making to HRD and connectivity among youth.
20. LSPN and CBN held a joint session to further prepare for the 6th HRDMM. In addition to agreeing roles and responsibilities, an extensive discussion was held on possible sub-themes for the HRDMM, as well as possible elements to an HRD Action Plan for 2015-2018.
21. On behalf of LSPN, the Coordinator thanked delegates of ABAC and the ILO for their participation in the meeting, continuing cooperation between our organizations.

ADOPTION OF SUMMARY CONCLUSIONS

22. The LS clarified the terms and conditions of the leadership of HRDWG and suggested the participating delegates to recommend candidates before the meeting or discuss the appointment of the new leaders intersessionally by September 30th.
23. HRDWG agreed in principle with the appointment of a Deputy Lead Shepherd. It was agreed that the TOR would be modified to reflect that the Lead Shepherd can appoint a Deputy Lead Shepherd in an emergency situation, for the remaining duration of his or her term, subject to endorsement by member economies and the government of the proposed Deputy LS. Amendment of TOR is subject to economy endorsement following this meeting.
24. Viet Nam summarized the progress on the 6th HRDMM drawing on the joint meeting with CBN and LSPN the previous day. The 6th HRDMM is expected to be held on September 6th with a meeting of officials on September 5th, side exhibition and events. During the joint workshop between CBN and LSPN, it was agreed that:

- Viet Nam would lead the drafting of the Ministerial Declaration, with China's assistance, and drawing on advice initially from Australia, Canada, Chinese Taipei, Papua New Guinea, Peru, the Philippines and the US.
 - The Lead Shepherd's Office would organise the preparation of a technical paper
 - The LSPN Coordinator would lead drafting of a report on the HRD Action Plan 2011-2014
 - The CBN Coordinator would lead drafting of a new four-year action plan
25. The thematic dialogue organized by China was welcomed and appreciated by member economies. Moderated by Mr Fu Yueqin, Director General, Center for International Exchange, Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security, the seminar was characterized by a lively and productive discussion on youth skills development, with a focus on the role of the government in building life-long vocational training systems and making vocational training targeted and effective. Delegates from fifteen member economies participated and ten member economies presented their experiences. The LS praised and appreciated the successful hosting by China.
26. LS expressed appreciation for the leadership and given by the co-chairs of our meetings including our hosts from China, and Network coordinators.
27. At the sidelines of HRDWG meetings, the delegates also visited Ningbo Zhenhai Scholar Innovation Park and Ningbo Vocational Training Institute.
28. Further development of the Strategic Plan, Annual Workplan and TOR will be undertaken out of session under the direction of the LS with the assistance of APEC Secretariat.
29. As per the future meetings, Viet Nam will host the 6th APEC HRDMM on 6th of September, 2014 and the date and venue of the 37th APEC HRDWG Meeting in the Philippines is to be announced.

[Annex 1] The Summary Report of the Preparatory Meeting for the HRD MM (February 16, 2014)

1. A Preparatory Meeting for the 6th APEC Human Resources Development Ministerial Meeting (HRDMM) was held on the morning of 16 February 2014, as part of the 36th APEC HRDWG Meeting in Ningbo, P.R. China.
2. Inviting Mr. Nguyen Xuan Tien, Deputy Director General of Foreign Economic Relations Dept. of the Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI) who took one of Co-Chairs, the Lead Shepherd and LSPN Coordinator jointly chaired the meeting, which opened at 9 am and welcomed participating delegates from : Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, People's Republic of China, Japan, Republic of Korea, Papua New Guinea, Peru, the Philippines, Russia, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, the United States and Viet Nam. Ms. Grace T. Cruz-Fabella, PD from the APEC Secretariat, three Network delegates: Mr. Malcolm Greening (LSPN Coordinator), Dr. Kuei-Yen Liao (CBN Deputy Coordinator) and Mr. Aaron Neumann (Assistant to EDNET Coordinator) were present as well.

Welcoming Remarks

3. Followed by the welcoming remarks of Mr. Nguyen Xuan Tien, LS, LSPN and CBN Coordinator made some introductory remarks including key issues of HRDWG in 2014 including HRDMM and Independent Assessment and main objectives for the meeting to achieve concrete progress on range of aspects to the preparations for the HRDMM: clarification of timing and meeting agendas, themes and sub-themes and possible efforts, cooperation between CBN and LSPN, and well-defined role and responsibilities.

Progress Report by Viet Nam on Preparation for the HRDMM

4. Ms. Hoang Tung Lam, the official of Foreign Economic Relations Department provided an update on the preparation, including: broad timing of the HRDMM (the first or second week of September 2014), a timeline of activities (largely around the drafting of papers), specific proposals for a theme and sub-themes, and possible outputs from the HRDMM. Tentatively, Viet Nam proposed one-day Ministerial Meeting together with a forum and exhibition. Viet Nam tabled a one-page update and delivered a more detailed presentation which will be separately circulated to HRDWG members.

General Discussion

There were two main areas of discussion: processes and themes.

Processes

5. In relation to processes, coordination in the timing of the HRDMM and the G20 Labour and Employment Ministers' Meeting in 2014 was encouraged.
6. It was also suggested that a meeting of officials be held immediately before the HRDMM to settle outstanding issues. During the course of the meeting, Viet Nam indicated that this official meeting would extend the length of the HRDMM to two days (one day for official meeting and one day for ministerial meeting).
7. Several member economies suggested that a further preparatory meeting be held in person to take stock of progress and discuss a draft Joint Statement for consideration by Ministers. A

number of options were raised, including a concept note for the preparatory workshop inviting experts, a meeting on the margin of the International Labour Conference in June or on the margin of a scheduled APEC event such as SOM II. As one of alternative options, China shared the information that utilizing the Youth Skill Summer Camp in late May in China could be an option. Further consideration would be given by Viet Nam and potential hosts to the best arrangement.

8. APEC Secretariat advised that the meeting or seminar on the preparatory meeting in a non-APEC region would not be supported by APEC fund, thus recommended to meet alongside the series of APEC events avoiding overlapped schedule. However, considering the timeline of the HRDMM, this kind of preparatory meeting might be held earlier before July.
9. In addition to the timeline for thematic papers, the LSPN and CBN Coordinator advised that consideration should also be given to the process for drafting the Ministers' Joint Statement and a further four-year APEC HRD Action Plan.

Themes

10. A broad-ranging discussion was held on the specific theme and sub-themes proposed by Viet Nam. There was broad support for Viet Nam's proposals, with a range of additional angles or areas for emphasis suggested by individual economies. For example, one of the suggestions for the theme of the HRDMM was "strengthening people-to-people connectivity and quality employment through human resources development" and the three sub-themes were "enhancing human resource quality to meet supply chain demands, facilitating mobility in the fields of labour and skills development, and supporting inclusive growth and sustainable development, addressing the social dimensions of globalization."
11. There was interest in a technical paper to inform the identification of themes and sub-themes; while the US proposed that technical experts be arranged to support the development of sub-theme papers. A number of economies recommended that experts in international organizations, such as the International Labour organization and OECD, be approached to support the HRDMM preparations.
12. Further discussion around the theme and sub-themes was deferred for later in the week of HRDWG annual meetings. There was particular interest in unpacking 'people-to-people connectivity'.

Others

13. LS encouraged member economies to support for Viet Nam as joining in the Preparatory Committee of HRDMM which was established in 2013 at Medan, Indonesia and composed of LS, three Network Coordinators, Australia, the Philippines, Chinese Taipei, Thailand and the United States. China expressed intent to join in the Committee.

Meeting Conclusion

14. LS noted that a joint workshop would be held by LSPN and CBN on 20 February 2014, as part of their annual meetings, to continue preparations for the HRDMM, with a report to be given at the closing plenary session of the HRDWG.

15. In conclusion, the Lead Shepherd summarized the outcomes of the meeting to be: (i) a two-day HRDMM (one day for official meeting and one day for ministerial meeting); (ii) a preparatory workshop considering options including possibly in late May in China; (iii) tentative theme and sub-themes to be discussed further during the LSPN/CBN workshop in the first instance. He encouraged economies to agree a concrete action plan for HRDMM preparations as a result of the discussions this week in Ningbo.
16. Viet Nam thanked economies for their assistance to date as they continue to prepare for a successful HRDMM in September 2014.
17. The meeting closed at around noon.

[Annex 2] The Summary Report of the Technical Meeting (February 18, 2014)

09:00-12:30

1. The technical meeting was led by the Lead Shepherd (LS) of the HRDWG, Dr. YoungHwan Kim. The co-chairs for this meeting were Mr. Hao Bin, Director General, Department of Int'l Cooperation, Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security, China and the Network Coordinators: Mr. Tsai, Meng-Liang (CBN), Dr. Kuei-Yen Liao (CBN Deputy Coordinator), Ms Adriana De Kanter (EDNET) and Mr. Malcolm Greening (LSPN). On this meeting, there were delegates from 16 economies: Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, People's Republic of China, Indonesia, Japan, Republic of Korea, Papua New Guinea, Peru, The Philippines, Russia, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, The United States and Viet Nam; and the APEC Secretariat.
2. The LS welcomed the participating delegates and adopted the agenda.
3. Republic of Korea presented the follow-up actions of APEC Education Ministerial Meeting 2012 with the achievements of ECP (Education Cooperation Project).
4. LSPN Coordinator reported the outcomes of the Preparatory Meeting for the 6th APEC HRD Ministerial Meeting (February 16). As the host economy, Viet Nam briefed the current status and activities preparing for the success of the Ministerial Meeting.
5. As a part of the HRDWG meeting, the thematic dialogue dealing with the Seminar on Youth Skills Development was briefed by China.
6. The LS invited the consultant of Independent Assessment to brief the overview, required actions and timeline of the assessment.
7. The LS introduced the progress on the strategic plan toward 2016 and the annual workplan for 2014 after the discussion in Medan, Indonesia. The LS and China jointly chaired this session and encouraged participating delegates to discuss how to update and revise the plans for HRDWG in order to prepare the Independent Assessment (IA) and HRDMM in Viet Nam. Also, the LS explained the TOR would be required to be updated because the current issues and conditions were not reflected into the document. The delegates scanned the documents but suggested to have clear guidelines how to update and revise them. Also, there was a suggestion to update the strategic plan and annual workplan.
8. The delegates deliberated ways to update and revise the documents such as organizing a core team with volunteers but allowed a group of the Lead Shepherd, Network Coordinators and APEC Secretariat to discuss and present a feasible way to carry out revised and updated documents.
9. At the group discussion, after the technical meeting, the delegates agreed to revise the documents by receiving the comments on these three items from participating member economies during the HRDWG meeting on site as circulating a survey and requesting the review of the expert group with support of the APEC Secretariat. The results of the survey would be briefed with gathered information such as number of economies giving feedback and main stream of the comments at the plenary closing session.

10. As per the last tenure of the LS and two coordinators (EDNET and LSPN), participating delegates discussed how to appoint new leaders of HRDWG. The LS encouraged the delegates to appoint candidates during the HRDWG meeting or consider appointing them intersessionally by September 2014.