

Summary Report
4th Counter-Terrorism Working Group
31 January – 01 February, 2015, Subic, Philippines

The **4th APEC Counter-Terrorism Working Group** was held at the Subic Grand Harbour Hotel, Subic Bay, the Philippines, 31 January to 1 February, 2015. The Meeting was presided by the Chair **Mr Oscar F. Valenzuela** (the Philippines) and assisted by the Secretariat's Program Director **Mr Diego Garcia**.

The two-day meeting was attended by 17 out of the 21 APEC member economies, namely. Australia, Brunei, Canada, Chile, China, Indonesia, Japan, Korea, Malaysia, Papua New Guinea, Peru, Philippines, Russia, Chinese Taipei, Thailand, United States and Viet Nam. The Members welcomed Undersecretary Mr Ferdinand Cui Jr., the representative of the SOM Vice-Chair.

Key outcomes of the 4th APEC Counter-Terrorism Working Group Meeting

Opening Remarks by the CTWG Chair

The CTWG Chair, Mr Oscar Valenzuela, welcomed all delegates to the 4th APEC Counter Terrorism Working Group (CTWG) Meeting. He expressed his gratitude to the members for the nomination of the Philippines as Chair of the working group.

Noting that while the Asia Pacific region enjoys relative peace just like other regions, it is directly affected by terrorist incidents committed elsewhere around the world. He added that no economy is completely immune from terrorism. As what was shown by recent incidents, economies that have not had any terrorism incident have become victims themselves.

Terrorism has continued to evolve and noted that in the recent years, terrorism activities were not only carried out by hierarchical and centralized organizations but also by smaller groups, cells, and lone actors apparently operating on their own and inspired by nationalists, separatist ideologies or groups advocating violent extremism.

The rapid growth of ISIS/ISIL/IS, Al-Qaeda-linked and other like-minded organizations in conflict-affected areas. He also noted the flow of recruits from many countries to join these groups. Although direct correlation has yet to be established between people who go abroad to fight and return home to carry out atrocities in their home countries, he mentioned that lately, concerns were raised on what could happen in the event these fighters return to their home countries.

The use of the cyberspace, particularly the use of internet and other social media, as tools for radicalization. He also mentioned that technological advancement has also brought more challenges in countering terrorism and securing trade. Terrorism and crime nexus today has become more pronounced. The security and law enforcement sector are striving to address the challenges brought by these developments. He suggested that the business and public sector must both be involved and be made aware of the implications of these developments especially on the threats posed by terrorists and the criminal groups.

Further, the Chair commended Ambassador Harry Purwanto of Indonesia, as the Chair of the former Counter-Terrorism Task Force (CTTF) and the first CTWG Chair.

The Chair emphasized the need to be aware of the evolving terrorism situation and accompanying challenges. He encouraged the members to be committed to the CTWG 2015 Work Plan and remain guided by the leaders and ministers' statements and the consolidated APEC Counter-Terrorism and Secure Trade Strategy.

The Chair also encouraged members to make use of their respective Counter Terrorism Action Plan as a tool in addressing counter terrorism and secure trade concerns of their respective economies.

Finally, the Chair expressed optimism that the Working Group will be able to meet its goals and objectives, with the active involvement of the delegates in the discussions and the identification of the action points to be pursued.

Adoption of the Final Annotated Agenda

The members reviewed and adopted the final annotated agenda **(2015/SOM1/CTWG/001)** for the meeting proposed by the Chair and endorsed the 3rd CTWG Meeting Summary Report prepared by the Secretariat **(2015/SOM1/CTWG/002)**.

Secretariat Issues and On-going Tasks

The APEC Secretariat reported the Budget Management Committee timeline, gave a briefing on the project funding and the Ranking and Prioritization Criteria, the New Scoring Template and also updated on the key developments since last SOM meeting **(2015/SOM1/CTWG/003 & 004)**. The Program Director emphasized the need to prepare the Concept Notes for funding approval in accordance with the guidelines and criteria. The members were informed that deadline for submission of concept notes for Project Session 1-2015 is February 17, for approval on May and June; and for Project Session 2-2015 is on July 1, for September and October approvals.

As explained by the Program Director, the ASF Supply Chain Connectivity (SCC) sub-fund aims to support the developing economies in overcoming specific obstacles in enhancing supply chain performance in line with the capacity building plan to be executed as part of the Systematic Approach to the supply Chain Connectivity Framework Action Plan (SCFAP). Core detailed guidance is uploaded in the APEC website <http://www.apec.org/Projects/Funding-Sources.aspx>

The members were encouraged to take advantage of the APEC Secretariat projects and opportunities specifically on the four crosscutting areas and submit their respective concept notes as well as to review the APEC guidebook for the development of the concept notes.

The APEC Secretariat Communications and Public Affairs Unit Media Manager commented about how the organization promotes priority issues and initiatives through various channels. He cited the significant focus projects, like the transportation security issues particularly on bus security, supply chains and regional mass alert system. Further, the member-economies were requested to raise suggestions and inputs on the different priority areas.

Report on Intersessional activities and CTWG achievements during 2014

The delegate from Indonesia expressed gratitude to the Philippines for the warm welcome and generous hospitality and conveyed the congratulatory message of Ambassador Harry Purwanto, former CTWG Chair, to the new CTWG Chair and member-economies. He reported on “The Intersessional Activities and CTWG Achievements During 2014” (2015/SOM1/CTWG/023), highlighting the updating of the CTWG Strategic Plan 2013-2017, which included Key Performance Indicators (KPI). The latest CTWG Strategic Plan was submitted to SOM Steering Committee on Economic and Technical Cooperation (SCE). However, he suggested that CTWG members continue to review the Plan and have it regularly reviewed as the scope and targets of the different activities under it become explicit and clearer through the years. The SCE Chair commended the CTWG for the specific identification of cross-cutting collaboration plans.

The delegate from Indonesia also recalled that during the 3rd CTWG meeting in Beijing, members lauded the Counter Terrorism Action Plans as the most valuable references for developing relevant and appropriate initiatives, addressing weakness and strength in APEC region. CTWG members acknowledged the importance of regular CTAP submissions and agreed to keep CTAP reports as basis for developing practical projects and initiatives.

He commented on the APEC “IX STAR Conference” on “Transportation Security in APEC Region: Challenges and Opportunities” (Beijing, 6-7 August 2014), jointly organized by China, Indonesia and the Russian Federation and attended by ninety (90) officials, as well as representatives of the private sector. The conference aimed to explore challenges and opportunities on key security issues of transportation system to facilitate movement of people, as well as addressed APEC economies initiatives to control threats in maritime transportation and dedicated one session to share experiences and best practices in ensuring restricted transportation security.

In relation to the implementation of the CTWG Work Plan, Indonesia reported on the CTWG activities conducted in the following four areas of capacity building:

- Secure Travel

The CTWG has conducted joint projects with BMG and SCCP to develop Trusted Traveler Characteristics and Best Practices on Implementing Advance Passenger Information System (API). The project on the Trusted Traveler Characteristic covers several areas such as developing characteristics; implementing workshops; pilot projects; and possibly forming a network of Trusted Traveler Programs among interested economies.

The CTWG conducted the CTWG Follow-on Bus Anti-Terrorism Workshop on 30-31 July 2014 in Manila, the Philippines. The workshop, which was attended by 50 Officials from 12 member economies, brought together the private sector, law enforcement, and policy practitioners to share and discuss the challenges and lessons learned associated with combating bus-terrorism at both the economic level and regional level. The Workshop also focused on reviewing and expanding the APEC toolbox of best practices that was developed during the 2012 workshop.

- Secure Finance

The CTWG has carried out a multi-year project on Protecting Designated Non-financial Businesses and Professions (DNFBPs) initiated and funded by Australia. The report of the outcomes of the project was presented by Australia.

The United States initiated the self-funded project on “Secure Finance Workshop on Countering Financing of Terrorism with New Payment Systems” which aims to raise APEC Economies’ awareness to the challenges and threats posed by National Payment Systems (NPS) in financing terrorism, as they are largely unregulated. The Workshop was held during SOM 1 in Subic, Philippines.

- **Secure Infrastructure**

CTWG has conducted the APEC-funded project on Major Events Security Framework. Canada has submitted the final report on the APEC Major Events Security Framework Projects based on the experiences of the two workshops conducted in 2013 and 2014.

CTWG has conducted the Workshop on Secure Infrastructure Critical Infrastructure Security: Enhancing Critical Infrastructure Security and Resilience (CISR) in the Asia-Pacific Region, held on 16-17 October 2014, in Chinese Taipei. The workshop aimed to build capacity between APEC Economies by sharing lessons learned and establishing best practices that promote security and resilience of critical trade and travel infrastructure.

- **Secure Supply Chains**

The United States briefed on the Joint CTWG/TPTWG/SCCP Global Trade Recovery Information Platform (GTRIP) **(2015/SOM1/CTWG/022)**. The GTRIP information system was presented in September 2014 and hopefully will become operational in 2015, with bilateral testing to happen between New Zealand and the United States, and then a launch workshop to be held in Singapore.

CTWG Work Plan 2015

The CTWG Chair presented the CTWG Workplan for 2015 **(2015/SOM1/CTWG/006)** and highlighted its key points. The Members discussed the proposed Work Plan, exchanged suggestions and inputs and finally endorsed it.

Among the recommendations and minor adjustments on the document provided by the members are as follows:

On Secure Finance, the Russian Federation proposed the phrase *“The CTWG will lead APEC efforts to prevent and combat terrorist financing and money laundering”*. These efforts will include implementing a capacity building workshop on counterterrorism financing as well as identifying vulnerabilities and priorities for future capacity building initiatives”. Also the members approved the Russian proposal to delete the phrase “with the participation of the non-profit organization sector”.

China commented on the Proposed Activities of the Work Plan 2015 and suggested eliminating the reference to UNSC Resolution 2178. In reaction, Australia, supported by the United States, maintained that the UNSC efforts will later intersect with the CTWG work which involves issues on secure trade. Subsequently, it was proposed the word “operational” from the phrase “exchange of operational information” be removed. Finally, members agreed to delete the mentioned reference.

China acknowledged the comments of the United States and Australia. However, it stressed that not all member-economies of the APEC are members of the United Nations Security Council, adding that adopting the UNSC Resolutions in the CTWG working plan would be unsuitable for China.

The Russia Federation, supported by Indonesia and the Philippines, proposed the removal of the phrase “cross border movement” explaining that it is not terrorism-related. It further suggested to just state “in countering Foreign Terrorist Fighters” in place of the phrase “cross border management.” The revised entry was changed to: *“CTWG to support programs that will strengthen APEC Member Economies’ collaboration in countering foreign terrorist fighters, and promoting exchange of information regarding action/movements of terrorist organizations”*.

The Chair encouraged members to submit proposals and projects, based on the CTWG Work Plan 2015, in order to enhance capabilities in countering terrorism. The CTWG Work Plan 2015 includes the expected outcomes/deliverables for 2015.

The CTWG Work Plan for 2015 was finally endorsed during the meeting.

2014 CTAP Summary Report

The APEC Secretariat reported on the 2014 CTAP Summary Report **(2015/SOM1/CTWG/007)** which contains the summary results in terms of capacity gaps and opportunities of the economies. The Secretariat received fifteen (15) individual CTAP updates from Brunei Darussalam, Canada, People's Republic of China, Chinese Taipei, Hong Kong, China, Malaysia, Mexico, Papua New Guinea, Republic of Korea, the Philippines, Singapore, Thailand, the Russian Federation, the United States and Viet Nam.

The results generally showed more opportunities than gaps: a total of 282 versus 242, in particular in the Protect Cargo section, which presented 109 vs 65, specifically related with the "Aviation security aspects and crisis management" sub-section. Meanwhile, in the protection of people in transit section, it was possible to consider the significant number of gaps associated with the "Exchange of experiences and information on lost, stolen and tampered passports" subsection. The APEC Secretariat highlighted the gaps presented for the "Exchange of security standards and screening techniques of high-risk containers," as well as the "APEC Framework for the Security and Facilitation of Global Trade", both from the Protect Cargo section.

The report revealed that the main opportunities offered by APEC economies were on *"Training in prevention of money laundering for financial employees, financial intelligence unit (FIU), enforcement agencies, judges and prosecutors to enhance law enforcement and regulatory capabilities"* and on *"Training on Anti-Money Laundering and Combating the Financing of Terrorism standards and techniques to discover, investigate and suite Money Laundering and Financing of Terrorism cases"*.

The delegate from Australia emphasized that the CTAP is a document designed to understand the gaps and trainings needed as well as the opportunity to use these information. He also inquired on how other member-economies give importance to the preparation of their respective CTAP. He proposed that the submission of the CTAP be put into the proper context, highlighting the importance of knowing the viability and the use of this information in order to serve its purpose, otherwise it will be fruitless to maintain it.

The Chair reiterated the importance of the timeline in the submission of the CTAP. Reiterating the significance of CTAP to member-economies, he encouraged delegates to invest more time and diligence in the preparation of their respective CTAP reports in order for the working group to have a clearer picture on the gaps and opportunities in sharing and upgrading of capabilities.

The United States revisited its recommendation during the 3rd CTWG Meeting to submit the respective CTAP reports every other year instead of an annual submission, explaining that this mechanism may maximize the compliance of member-economies. Australia concurred to the United States' proposal, explaining that it would be more convenient and manageable for member-economies to reduce the challenges in providing the updates annually because of resource constraint.

The People's Republic of China, the Philippines, Chinese Taipei, Viet Nam, Papua New Guinea, Brunei Darussalam and the Russian Federation gave their CTAP updates and shared presentations on the latest developments regarding their counterterrorism measures and legislation recently adopted.

Finally, the Chair noted the suggestions on the submission of CTAP and recommended the inclusion of the proposal in the next CTWG meeting agenda. The delegates agreed that the member economies individual report submission will be discussed during the next CTWG Meeting in the margins of SOM2.

The APEC 2015 Priorities

SOM Vice-Chair Undersecretary Ferdinand Cui Jr., presented the *APEC 2015 Theme and Priorities*. Under the theme “*Building Inclusive Economies, Building a Better World*”, four priorities were identified: (1) enhancing regional economic integration; (2) fostering participation of small and medium enterprises in regional and global markets; (3) investing in human capital development; and, (4) building sustainable and resilient communities. The economies were encouraged to bring up proposals and initiatives since these priorities emphasized on “everyone benefits, everyone contributes”.

As a final point, the SOM Vice-Chair encouraged members to submit clear, relevant and measurable set of APEC 2015 initiatives by the end of the year 2015, to ensure that the APEC 2015 Leaders’ Declaration become relevant to the people of the Asia-Pacific region.

Implementation of the CTWG Work Plan and the Counter-Terrorism and Secure Trade Strategy’s cross-cutting activity areas

The delegate of Canada provided updates on the “Major Events Security Framework” (MESF), an online portal which provides tool to plan major events security. The final version of the MESF will be posted on the APEC website. It is password protected, and member-economies are enjoined to provide lessons learned and use the MESF tool and provide feedback.

The Russian Federation delegate expressed interest in the MESF and inasmuch as his country will be hosting the World Cup 2018, the preparation of report on MESF will be appreciated.

The Chair commented that more activities in line with the MESF should be conducted regularly.

The United States expressed support for Canada’s leadership on MESF issues, and encouraged the members to collaborate and share best practices so that everybody can learn from each other.

On Secure Supply Chains, the United States provided updates on the joint CTWG/TPTWG/SCCP Trade Recovery Project, stating that it is looking forward to operationalize the program. Once the system becomes accessible online, member economies can collaborate among themselves with ease and convenience. The United States, together with the support of Singapore, will conduct a workshop on information-sharing.

On Secure Travel, the United States, as Coordinator of the Travel Facilitation Initiative Steering Council, briefed on the 2015 Report to the SCE (**2015/SOM1/CTWG/025**).

The Russian Federation briefed on the national best practices on combating the financing of ISIL.

The United States provided an update on the self-funded project “*Secure Finance Workshop on Countering the Financing of Terrorism with New Payment Systems*” held in 2015.

On Secure Infrastructure, the United States presented an update on the self-funded *Workshop on Secure Infrastructure: “Critical Infrastructure Security and Resilience”*.

Activities in other International Fora

The Chair requested the members to present the activities and measures they have implemented related to countering terrorism as well as their undertakings in other international fora.

The delegate from Canada cited the Global Counter Terrorism Forum (GCTF) as a significant platform to combat acts of terrorism. She reported its efforts to address domestic security threats, the most significant of which is the recent passage of relevant legislations to address the issue on Foreign Terrorist Fighters (FTFs), noting that such measure also have an impact internationally. In relation to this, Canada has already convicted one of its nationals for attempting to join foreign terrorist group. It is also considering changing the listing of regimes to listing individuals.

Aside from these initial steps, the Canadian delegate disclosed that the Prime Minister of Canada proposed a complete package of measures that includes:

- Criminalizing the promotion of terrorism in general, thereby empowering law enforcement agencies in addressing terrorism threats; and,
- Arrest and detention of suspected terrorists before they can harm the community.

Canada also stated that such measures show its focus wherein preventing radicalization is one of its utmost concerns. It is looking into the preventive measures to avoid its national from leaving Canada and travelling to conflict areas to join FTFs.

The Chair commended the efforts of Canada in doing modifications and in strengthening its national legislation to address the emerging threats of Violent Extremism (VE).

Australia reported that on 30 October 2014, a legislative amendment was implemented, particularly the Foreign Terrorist Fighters (FTFs) Act of 2014. The act seeks to strengthen and monitor, investigate and prosecute terrorism related incidents specifically the FTFs. The act of encouraging terrorism act is also criminalized. Australia continues to work consistently with its entire department in support of its national approach in Counter Terrorism.

Australia also reported that it declared the province of Al Raqqa in Syria a “No Go” area wherein it is a criminal offense to enter or remain in the declared Syrian province. This measure aims to send a strong message to address the government’s stand on FTFs.

China reported that it supports the continuous efforts of every economy to address Counter-Terrorism amid the growing number of terrorist organizations using internet as tool in recruitment and spreading Violent Extremism (VE) narratives. In support towards this effort against the terrorist use of the cyberspace, China sponsored a symposium in 2014 regarding the use of internet, highlighting that 90 participants from various international organizations and member-economies attended the discussions. The participants contributed best practices approaches and ways how to address the threats brought about by social media. China also vowed its support to international cooperation in the secure use of internet and expressed willingness to cooperate with member-economies to prevent terrorism-related activities using internet.

The United States encouraged all delegates to consult the Global Counter Terrorism Forum The Hague-Marrakesh Memorandum on Good Practices for a More Effective Response to the Foreign Terrorist Fighter (FTF) Phenomenon, which is located on thegctf.org website and added that it is a significant document that each member economy can draw lessons from to help counter FTFs. The United States also inquired whether member economies would be interested in the CTWG holding a workshop that addresses the secure travel aspects related to the FTF phenomenon and participants responded favourably to the idea

The Philippines reported on the following Counter-Terrorism undertakings:

- On Secure Travel:

The Philippines conducted the 1st Working Group Meeting on Foreign Terrorist Fighter Project under INTERPOL Task Force “Pacific”; and the Integrated Border Management Task Force of the INTERPOL projects, sponsored by Canada.

The Philippines undertook the Japan ASEAN Integrated Fund (JAIF)-sponsored workshop on the means and extent of radicalization’s influence and its impact to vulnerable migrants, such as the Overseas Workers.

- On Secure Supply Chains:

In collaboration with INTERPOL, the Philippines initiated the 4th INTERPOL Radiological and Nuclear Investigations Training Course and Chemical Anti-Smuggling Enforcement (CHASE) Crime Scene Management Course.

The Philippines is currently hosting the CBRN Centre of Excellence Regional Secretariat for Southeast Asia, an initiative of the European Union (EU).

The conduct of JAIF-supported workshop that promotes further enhancement to regulatory regimes against the Tools of Terrorism.

- On Secure Finance:

The Philippines will undertake capability enhancement to monitor and regulate the flow of funds for terrorist activities passing through formal and informal channels. The workshop funded by JAIF will be conducted this 2015.

- On Secure Infrastructure:

The Philippines is implementing a UNODC-supported training program on Collaborative Intelligence, Investigation and Prosecution of Terrorism-Related Cases, in which a training manual has been developed and a national training pool has been trained and organized.

Other Relevant International Engagements

The Philippines has been collaborating with the International Centre on Counter-Terrorism (ICCT-The Hague) on the development of a holistic rehabilitation and reintegration program for Violent Extremist Offenders (VEOs). This project helped design the Philippine National Roadmap in Countering Violent Extremism.

The Republic of Korea reported on its Cyber Security efforts and its collaboration with the United States, India, China and Japan. It hosted two major events: the ASEAN games and Korea ASEAN meeting wherein it shared security information with other international law enforcement agencies. South Korea also reported that it has intensified measures on Foreign Terrorist Fighters (FTFs), noting that one Korean National was reported to have joined the fighting in Syria in support of the ISIS/ISIL/IS. The reported Korean FTF was reportedly radicalized through social media, thus the government is intensifying its effort in finding ways to prevent future ISIL recruitment. Finally South Korea expressed its concerns regarding the need to prevent unlimited online sharing in the internet.

Closing Remarks and Next Meeting

The Chair expressed his sincere gratitude to the members for their fruitful participation and contributions, to the APEC National Organizing Committee and the Conference Management Services for their valuable assistance in the conduct of the CTWG meeting, the Subic Bay Metropolitan Authority for the generous hospitality, and the members of the APEC Secretariat for the guidance for the success of the CTWG plans and projects.

The Chair stated that the CTWG efforts would provide necessary tools, knowledge and skills to combat terrorism and mitigate its effects in the respective economies and highlighted that the various ideas and discussions during the meeting have established better connections and collaboration between member-agencies.

The Chair indicated that with the finalization of the CTWG Work Plan for 2015, together with APEC priorities, every member economy can benefit from the ideals and aims of these instruments. The Chair added that the various projects on secure trade, secure travel, secure finance and secure infrastructure have been generously funded and organized by member-economies. Thus, everyone is

encouraged to support and participate in these activities to maximize the effects of the projects. The Chair added that every economy should adapt to the changing landscape and challenges posed by terrorism, while encouraged all delegates to collaborate with each other to be able to build stronger and better economies in the future.

The next CTWG Meeting will be held in the margins of SOM2, 10 - 11 May 2015, in Boracay Island, Aklan, the Philippines.