

2021/TPTWG/WKSP4/011

Project Final Report: A Comprehensive Strategy for Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector Within APEC Economies

Submitted by: United States



Workshop on Combating Human Trafficking
Across the Transportation Sector
14 December 2021



A COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY FOR COMBATING HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN THE TRANSPORTATION SECTOR WITHIN APEC ECONOMIES

APEC Transportation Working Group Project

Combating Human Trafficking by Addressing Illicit Uses of Transportation

Table of Contents

1.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
2.	INTRODUCTION	5
3.	COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY ELEMENTS	8
	3.1 Laws	8
	3.2 Leadership	
	3.3 Policies	
	3.4 Reporting Protocols	14
	3.5 Training	15
	3.6 Partnerships	19
	3.7 Public Awareness	20
	3.8 Data Collection and Information-Sharing	23
	3.9 Victim and Survivor Support	24
4.	CONCLUSION	25
5.	APPENDICES	27
	5.1 Model Tools	27
	5.1.1 Comprehensive Strategy	27
	5.1.2 Proclamation	31
	5.1.3 Public Leadership Statement	33
	5.2 Modal Indicators	34

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Human trafficking is a multi-billion-dollar criminal enterprise, which affects 24.9 million men, women, and children globally, with intersections across every mode of transportation. Human traffickers utilize all modes of transportation, including roadways, railways, waterways, and airways to facilitate the trafficking of human beings. When victims travel to meet their trafficker initially, or use transportation during their victimization, an opportunity arises for properly equipped transportation employees and the traveling public to identify and report a tip to human trafficking hotlines and law enforcement. Transportation employees and the traveling public are uniquely positioned to alert hotlines and law enforcement authorities to potential incidents of human trafficking that may occur on any form of transportation.

Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) statements and strategic plans emphasize the importance of ensuring the safety of transportation systems through counter-trafficking efforts. The 2017 Ministerial Statement encourages training APEC transportation ministries, transportation agencies, transportation service providers, and the public to identify human trafficking and halt illicit economic activity.² The APEC Transportation Working Group Strategic Plan for 2018-2020 encourages more enforced measures against human trafficking.³

This Comprehensive Strategy for Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector within APEC Economies seeks to provide an overview of the intersection of human trafficking and the transportation sector, and to equip transportation ministries, agencies, and operators with guidance and recommendations to inform their own development of comprehensive countertrafficking strategies. Economies should implement this guidance within the context of broader multimodal counter-trafficking initiatives and share it broadly across government agencies.

This strategy covers the key elements for a comprehensive approach, including human trafficking laws, leadership, policies (including social responsibility and employee responsibilities), reporting protocols, partnerships (including law enforcement and non-governmental organizations ("NGOs")), training, public awareness, data collection and information-sharing, and victim and survivor support. Additional resources within the appendices offer counter-trafficking tools for transportation ministries, agencies, and operators to adapt and tailor, including a model comprehensive counter-trafficking strategy, proclamation, and public leadership statement.

As APEC economies progress in the development of their counter-trafficking initiatives, they are encouraged to adopt an approach most beneficial to victims and survivors by ensuring that law enforcement, and the hotlines typically operated by NGOs that respond to potential instances of

¹ See International Labour Organization and Walk Free Foundation, *Global Estimates of Modern Slavery: Forced Labour and Forced Marriage* (2017), available at https://www.ilo.org/global/publications/books/WCMS_575479/lang--en/index.htm.

² See Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation, *Transportation Ministerial Statement* (2017), available at https://www.apec.org/meeting-papers/sectoral-ministerial-meetings/transportation/2017_transport.

³ Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation, *Transportation Working Group Strategic Plan for 2018-2020* (2018), available at https://www.apec.org/docs/default-source/groups/tptwg/18_sce3_003_tptwg-strategic-plan-2018-2020.docx.

human trafficking, are survivor-informed, victim-centered, and trauma-informed. Doing so ensures that first responders to reports of human trafficking understand how trauma may affect victims' responses to law enforcement and any services being offered. The goal of such an approach is to prioritize the victim's safety and security, maximize cooperation, and ensure effective interventions by avoiding re-traumatization.⁴ With survivor-informed, victim-centered, and trauma-informed training, law enforcement can more effectively deliver immediate and appropriate emergency assistance, and hotlines can better provide non-emergency referrals and direct services to victims. In addition to improving responses to human trafficking, adopting a survivor-informed, victim-centered, and trauma-informed approach increases the quality of human trafficking prevention efforts.

National, regional, and local strategies for transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should be comprehensive. Section 5 of this document provides a model strategy for transportation ministries, agencies, and operators to customize. The model comprehensive strategy addresses the following areas and actions:

- Laws: Key international and economy human trafficking laws in the operating locations should be outlined and easily referenced.
- Leadership: A proclamation⁵ and public leadership statement⁶ should be issued that outlines the proactive steps the organization is taking to combat human trafficking. Any national strategy or action plan should be encouraged to underscore transportation's important role in combating human trafficking.
- **Policies:** a) A survivor-informed zero-tolerance policy regarding human trafficking should be adopted, and include zero-tolerance clauses in contractual agreements with companies, agencies, and other stakeholders; and b) Survivor-informed employee counter-trafficking guidelines should be instituted that address organizational resources, business practices, and violations.
- Reporting Protocols: Clear protocols for employees to report suspected instances of human trafficking to survivor-informed, victim-centered, and trauma-informed hotlines and law enforcement should be implemented.
- Training: Personnel should be trained to recognize and report suspected instances of human trafficking by using survivor-informed training materials.
- **Partnerships:** Partnerships with government agencies, victim-centered and traumainformed law enforcement, NGOs, and other public and private stakeholders should be established, as appropriate, to increase victim identification, share information, and

⁴ See United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Global Programme Against Trafficking in Human Beings, Toolkit to Combat Trafficking in Persons (2006), available at https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/HT-toolkit-en.pdf.

⁵ See Proclamation in Appendix 5.1.2.

⁶ See Public Leadership Statement in Appendix 5.1.3.

maximize their collective impact in combating human trafficking. If they exist, join human trafficking task forces.

- **Public Awareness:** Partnerships with public and private entities should be established to implement survivor-informed human trafficking public awareness campaigns for transportation personnel and the traveling public. Print, audio, and digital awareness materials should include transport sector indicators of human trafficking and contact information for victim-centered, trauma-informed hotlines and law enforcement.
- **Data Collection and Information-Sharing:** Reports of human trafficking made by transportation employees and the traveling public should be tracked and shared with transport ministries and other relevant authorities that collect economy-wide data.
- Victim and Survivor Support: Victim and survivor support should be implemented by strategically disseminating and placing public awareness information and materials, placing law enforcement in high-risk locations, and incorporating counter-trafficking into corporate social responsibility programs, which may include donating airline mileage, providing travel vouchers, and offering workforce development and employment opportunities to help survivors of human trafficking.

Implementation of these recommendations in APEC economies can help to increase the identification, reporting, and investigation of suspected instances of human trafficking.

2. INTRODUCTION

Human trafficking, or trafficking in persons, involves the recruitment, transport, transfer, harboring or receipt of a person by such means as threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, abduction, fraud or deception for the purpose of exploitation. Of the 24.9 million people trafficked globally, women and girls make up 99% of the victims in commercial sexual exploitation and 58% in other sectors. Sixty-six percent are estimated to be trafficked within the Pacific Rim, making this a problem that inordinately affects women globally and within the APEC region.

A 2018 analysis of data regarding over 80,000 trafficked persons from 171 countries by the Counter-Trafficking Data Collaborative, a United Nations (UN) International Organization for Migration initiative, found that nearly 80% of international human trafficking cases crossed

⁷ See UN General Assembly, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (2000)*, available at https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en. For further background on trafficking in persons, ICAO Circular 352 on "Guidelines for Training Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons" includes additional information such as the elements of trafficking, why trafficking happens, the types of trafficking, and general indicators of trafficking.

⁸ See International Labour Organization and Walk Free Foundation, *Global Estimates of Modern Slavery: Forced Labour and Forced Marriage* (2017), available at https://www.ilo.org/global/publications/books/WCMS_575479/lang--en/index.htm.

official ports of entry. Among instances of trafficking involving official border entry methods, approximately 34% were by bus, 33% by train, 20% by airplanes, and 11% by car. Among instances involving unofficial border entry methods, 28% were by car, 26% by bus, 15% by train, and 12% by boat. Two other studies also found trafficking occurring across all modes of transportation. A Polaris study of 104 survivors found that during their experience, 81% traveled by a personal vehicle, 47% by taxis, 38% by airplanes, 33% by public buses, 19% by subway, 19% by long distance buses, 11% by long distance rail, 9% by ridesharing (which continues to increase in frequency), and 3% by cruise ships. An Urban Institute study of 122 labor trafficking survivors found that 71% of the survivors were transported to the United States by airplane, and 52% were transported by car or van. 11

Social, economic, and educational policies based on gender, ethnic, and cultural considerations increase the vulnerability of some groups to human trafficking. ¹² Victims are recruited in person and online through promises of jobs, support, or love. Transportation hubs such as bus depots and train stations often serve as initial recruitment sites, particularly for children. ¹³ They are coerced or forced into human trafficking through emotional abuse, economic abuse, isolation, threats, and physical abuse. Some victims are trafficked within their own communities, while others are transported to new locations using all modes of transportation. ¹⁴ Many are trafficked on "circuits" through multiple cities and regions, and moved before they can establish relationships that could result in identification, ensuring their reliance on their traffickers. ¹⁵ Victims are controlled by traffickers through restricting their freedom of movement, excessive working hours, psychological abuse, confiscation of earnings, debt bondage, threats to themselves or others, and threats of action by law enforcement. Grooming methods employed by traffickers lead to victims often not identifying themselves as victims of human trafficking, and to a general distrust of law

-

⁹ See Counter-Trafficking Data Collaborative (a UN International Organization for Migration initiative), *Types of Border Crossings Victims of Trafficking Make* (ND) available at https://www.ctdatacollaborative.org/story/victims-trafficking-road ¹⁰ See Polaris, *On-Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018)*, available at https://polarisproject.org/on-ramps-intersections-and-exit-routes.

¹¹ See Urban Institute, *Understanding the Organization, Operation, and Victimization Process of Labor Trafficking in the United States (2014)*, available at https://www.urban.org/research/publication/understanding-organization-operation-and-victimization-process-labor-trafficking-united-states.

¹² See United Nations: Office on Drugs & Crime, An Introduction to Human Trafficking: Vulnerability, Impact and Action (2008), available at https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/An_Introduction_to_Human_Trafficking_-_Background_Paper.pdf.

¹³ See Polaris, On-Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018), available at https://polarisproject.org/on-ramps-intersections-and-exit-routes.

¹⁴ See Polaris, On-Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018), available at https://polarisproject.org/on-ramps-intersections-and-exit-routes.

¹⁵ See Ibanez, Michelle, and Daniel D. Suthers, *Detection of Domestic Human Trafficking Indicators and Movement Trends Using Content Available on Open Internet Sources (2014)*, Proceedings of the Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences. Washington: Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers. 1556-1565

enforcement. 16 Victims who identify as victims may fear that reporting will result in harm to themselves or loved ones. 17

The point at which victims intersect with transportation systems provides a critical opportunity for transportation personnel such as airline cabin crew, ticketing agents, truck drivers, commercial delivery drivers, taxi and rideshare drivers, bus drivers, rail crew, ship crew, shuttle crew, ground crew, baggage handlers, security staff, car rental companies, limousine companies, gas stations, convenience stores, and cleaning crews at transportation hubs, among others, to recognize and report suspected instances of human trafficking. When equipped with the knowledge to recognize and report potential instances of human trafficking to victim-centered, trauma-informed human trafficking hotlines¹⁸ and law enforcement, ¹⁹ transportation ministries, agencies, and operators can play an important role in helping to intercept and prevent human trafficking.

The Project proposal for this comprehensive strategy that was submitted and approved by the APEC Transportation Working Group (TPTWG) stated that

This project combats human trafficking by developing tools to help identify potential victims who utilize transportation systems, which can reduce barriers for vulnerable populations to join the economy, increasing economic growth. By surveying ongoing efforts among the APEC economies related to transportation, this project will develop a set of best practices and educational resources for employee training and public awareness. These resources can be used by each economy to educate transportation employees and the traveling public to report potential human trafficking to the proper authorities.

To bring the set of counter-trafficking best practices and educational resources to fruition, a survey of economy-level efforts, two webinars, and a final workshop were conducted (virtually, to accommodate the COVID-19 pandemic). In January 2020, a survey of economy-based transportation ministries was conducted on counter-trafficking approaches, methods, and tools to develop a baseline assessment of economy-level efforts to mitigate human trafficking in the transportation system. Submissions were received from Canada, Chinese Taipei, and Malaysia. Two webinars were held in September and October 2020 to highlight modal counter-trafficking initiatives in several APEC economies for transportation ministries, transportation agencies, transport operators, law enforcement, and civil society organizations to encourage increased action to combat the crime. In December 2021, a final workshop was held for transportation ministries, transportation agencies, transport operators, law enforcement, and civil society organizations which highlighted counter-trafficking best practices and resources from transportation-related multilateral and regional fora, economy-level governments, industry associations, and NGOs.

¹⁶ See United Nations International Organization for Migration Trafficking in Persons, *Victim Identification and Assistance* (2020), available at https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/trafficking-in-persons-training-guide.pdf.

¹⁸ Human trafficking hotlines connect victims and survivors of sex and labor trafficking with social and legal resources.

¹⁹ Law enforcement can help victims to safely escape human trafficking situations.

Drawing upon input received through the survey, best practices shared, and evaluations, this report recommends that economies adopt a comprehensive strategy to combat human trafficking across all modes of transportation. This report was informed by input received from human trafficking survivor expert consultants.

3. COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY ELEMENTS

Transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should take particular care to ensure that they engage with human trafficking survivor-advocates in the development of a Comprehensive Strategy so that it is survivor-informed, with meaningful input from diverse survivors at every stage. Given their firsthand knowledge of the experience of human trafficking, survivor-advocates can provide critical input to ensure counter-trafficking initiatives are robust and practical. Comprehensive Strategies should be inclusive of the following elements.²⁰

3.1 Laws

Legal frameworks are key foundational tools for combating human trafficking. Although the scope and definition of human trafficking may vary between member economy counter-trafficking laws, commonalities include an emphasis on prevention, protection, and prosecution as well as an understanding that trafficking 1) requires an action, means, and purpose; 2) affects adults and children of any gender; 3) lacks consent; 4) does not require movement or border crossings; 5) is distinct from human smuggling; and 6) involves a range of labor and sexually exploitative practices.

In 2000, the United Nations' (UN) adoption of the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children* (also known as the Palermo Protocol)²¹ marked a significant benchmark in international efforts to combat human trafficking. The purpose of the Palermo Protocol is to prevent and combat trafficking in persons, to protect and assist victims of trafficking, and to promote cooperation among States Parties to meet these objectives. The Protocol, which has been signed and ratified by 178 UN members, requires implementing measures to prevent means of transport operated by transport operators from being used in the commission of human trafficking.

Examples of economy-level general counter-trafficking legislation include Chinese Taipei's 2016 The Human Trafficking Prevention Act, ²² Indonesia's 2007 Criminal Act of Trafficking in

²⁰ Appendix 1, Section 5.1.1's Comprehensive Strategy provides a model strategy for transportation ministries and operators to adapt.

²¹ See UN General Assembly, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (2000)*, available at https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en.

²² See Laws and Regulations Database of Chinese Taipei, *Human Trafficking Prevention Act* (2016), available at https://law.moj.gov.tw/ENG/LawClass/LawAll.aspx?pcode=D0080177.

Persons,²³ Malaysia's 2007 Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act,²⁴ the Philippines' 2003 Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act,²⁵ Mexico's 2012 General Law to Prevent, Sanction, and Eradicate Crimes Related to Trafficking in Persons,²⁶ and the United States' 2000 Trafficking Victims Protection Act.²⁷ Some economies have also implemented counter-trafficking supply chain laws that bear relevance for the transportation sector. Australia's 2018 Modern Slavery Act requires all companies operating in Australia and meeting a threshold of AU\$100 million in total annual global revenue to report annually on their efforts to address human trafficking in their operations and supply chains.²⁸

The United States advanced several transport-specific counter-trafficking laws with passage of the 2016 Federal Aviation Administration Extension, Safety and Security Act,²⁹ the 2018 Combating Human Trafficking in Commercial Vehicles Act,³⁰ the 2018 No Human Trafficking on Our Roads Act,³¹ the 2018 Federal Aviation Administration Reauthorization Act,³² the 2019 Frederick Douglass Trafficking Victims Prevention and Protection Reauthorization Act,³³ and the 2021 Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act.³⁴ Collectively, these laws expand grant programs, provide training for air carrier flight attendants and other public facing employees, track air carrier training and tip reports, institute a lifetime ban on Commercial Driver's License holders who use a commercial vehicle to commit a severe form of human trafficking, establish a multimodal Department of Transportation Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking (ACHT), and ensure that the ACHT submits triennial recommendations and best practice reports.

Once transportation ministries, agencies, and operators have ensured that their comprehensive strategies are informed by international and economy human trafficking laws in addition to

²³ See International Labour Organization, *Indonesia Elimination of Forced Labour Act* (2007), available at https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/natlex4.detail?p_lang=en&p_isn=76863.

²⁴ See International Labour Organization, *Malaysia Elimination of Forced Labour Act* (2007), available at https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/natlex4.detail?p_lang=en&p_isn=79357&p_country=MYS&p_count=199.

²⁵ See Republic of the Philippines, *Republic Act 9208: Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act (2003)*, available at https://pcw.gov.ph/republic-act-9208-anti-trafficking-in-persons-act-of-2003.

²⁶ See Global Regulation, *General Law to Prevent, Punish, and Eradicate Crime in Trafficking in Persons and Protecting and Assisting the Victims of These Crimes* (2012), available at https://www.global-regulation.com/translation/mexico/560308/general-law-to-prevent%252c-punish-and-eradicate-crime-in-trafficking-in-persons-and-protecting-and-assisting-the-victims-of-these-crimes.html.

²⁷ See Government Publishing Office, *Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act (2000)*, available at https://www.govinfo.gov/content/pkg/PLAW-106publ386/pdf/PLAW-106publ386.pdf.

²⁸ See Australia, Modern Slavery Act 2018, No. 153 (2018), available at https://www.legislation.gov.au/Details/C2018A00153.

²⁹ See United States of America, FAA Extension, Safety, and Security Act of 2016, Public Law 114-190 [H.R. 636] (2016), available at https://www.congress.gov/114/plaws/publ190/PLAW-114publ190.pdf.

³⁰ See Congress.gov, *H.R.3813*, *Combating Human Trafficking in Commercial Vehicles Act (2017)*, available at https://www.congress.gov/bill/115th-congress/house-bill/3813/text.

³¹ See Congress.gov, *S.1532*, *No Human Trafficking on Our Roads Act* (2018), available at https://www.congress.gov/bill/115th-congress/senate-bill/1532/text?r=5.

³² See United States of America, *FAA Reauthorization Act of 2018, Public Law 115-254 [H.R. 302] (2018)*, available at https://www.congress.gov/115/plaws/publ254/PLAW-115publ254.pdf.

³³ See Congress.gov, H.R.2200, Frederick Douglass Trafficking Victims Prevention and Protection Reauthorization Act (2018), available at: https://www.congress.gov/bill/115th-congress/house-

 $bill/2200/text?q=\%7B\%22search\%22\%3A\%5B\%22Frederick+Douglass+Trafficking+Victims+Prevention+and+Protection+Rea\ uthorization+Act+of+2017\%22\%5D\%7D\&r=1.$

 $^{^{34}}$ See Congress.gov, H.R.3684, $Infrastructure\ Investment\ and\ Jobs\ Act\ (2021)$, available at https://www.congress.gov/bill/117th-congress/house-bill/3684/text?q=%7B%22search%22%3A%5B%223684%22%2C%223684%22%5D%7D&r=57&s=4.

regional commitments, they should take an organizational stand against human trafficking throtheir leadership.	ough

3.2 LEADERSHIP

Counter-trafficking strategies, policies, and protocols require leadership support to be successful. Leadership decisions are critical in obligating resources, implementing programs, measuring impact, and engaging with stakeholders. Multiple international and regional fora have made transport-specific leadership commitments to date.

Counter-trafficking commitments appear in two APEC TPTWG Ministerial Statements. In 2013, during the APEC Transportation Ministerial Meeting in Japan, Transportation Ministers committed to raise awareness regarding human trafficking:

We condemn any use of the transportation system by human traffickers within and across our borders...Given that our transportation networks could be exploited by traffickers seeking to move their victims, we direct the TPTWG to explore ways to increase watchfulness and deter and prevent human traffickers from using our transportation networks.³⁵

In 2017, APEC Transportation Ministers expanded their 2013 counter-trafficking commitments during the Ministerial in Papua New Guinea to include training:

We commend the work initiated on human trafficking and encourage the TPTWG to continue to discourage the use of any transportation network by human traffickers within and across our borders. By training the general public, transportation service providers and APEC transportation ministries to identify human trafficking that is hidden in plain sight, we can save lives, halt illicit economic activity, help report instances of human trafficking to the proper law enforcement authorities and demonstrate our integral role in the wellbeing of our respective societies.³⁶

In 2019, members of the UN International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO), took a public stand against human trafficking by adopting a counter-trafficking resolution during the 40th Session of the ICAO Assembly that underscores the importance of aviation personnel training, model reporting protocols, victim-centered and trauma-informed law enforcement, raising public awareness, and ensuring that relevant guidance material related to the issue of human trafficking is current and responsive to the needs of members. ³⁷

International transportation organizations such as the International Air Transport Association (IATA) and Airports Council International (ACI) took similar action with the adoption of the 2018

³⁵ See Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, *APEC Transportation Ministerial Meeting (2013)*, available at https://www.apec.org/Meeting-Papers/Sectoral-Ministerial-Meetings/Transportation/2013_transport.

³⁶ See Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, *APEC Transportation Ministerial Meeting (2017)*, available at https://www.apec.org/meeting-papers/sectoral-ministerial-meetings/transportation/2017_transport.

³⁷ See International Civil Aviation Organization, *Resolutions Adopted by the Assembly: 40th Session. Montreal: ICAO (2020)*, available at https://www.icao.int/Meetings/a40/Documents/Resolutions/a40_res_prov_en.pdf.

IATA Resolution Against Trafficking in Persons,³⁸ and the 2016 ACI World General Assembly Prevention of Human Trafficking resolution.³⁹ IATA's resolution emphasizes collaboration with government authorities and civil society, encourages training relevant operational staff, and calls on government authorities to establish clear reporting mechanisms. ACI's resolution promotes raising awareness through media and at industry fora, urges employee training, and supports partnering with governments, charities, and NGOs to prevent human trafficking.

In addition to regional commitments through APEC, in 2015 the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), another regional multilateral fora that includes several APEC economies, adopted the *Convention Against Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, which requires preventing transport from being used to facilitate human trafficking. ⁴⁰

As an economy-level example of transport-specific counter-trafficking leadership, in the United States, the U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT) established an Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking (ACHT) in 2018. The ACHT is comprised of representatives across all modes of transportation, labor associations, NGOs, and law enforcement to develop counter-trafficking guidance and best practices for public entities, private industry, NGOs, and local transportation authorities. The 2019 ACHT report includes training and awareness best practices, quick implementation guides for each mode of transportation, sample materials, and a model proclamation for transportation organizations to demonstrate their commitment to combating human trafficking. Such guidance is supported by the 2021 *United States National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking*, which emphasizes counter-trafficking in the transportation sector through partnerships, training, and public awareness. 42

In addition to issuing a proclamation and public leadership statement to combat human trafficking in the transportation sector, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should implement counter-trafficking organizational policies.

3.3 POLICIES

The provision of clear policies regarding employee responsibilities and safety practices in addition to organizational social responsibility are key elements of a robust counter-trafficking strategy, as emphasized in the UN International Maritime Organization's *Interim Measures for Combating*

³⁸ See International Air Transport Association, *Resolution Against Trafficking in Persons (2018)*, available at https://www.iata.org/contentassets/ 8e5bb5f5bfa04057a8826cf042cd4df9/resolution-trafficking-persons-agm2018.pdf.

³⁹ See Airports Council International, *Resolution No. 2: Prevention of Human Trafficking (2016)*, available at https://aci.aero/Media/2492051a-5919-4bc8-849b-bceeb0c57b20/zIsNRw/News/Releases/2016/09-28-2016%20Human%20Trafficking/20160928_Human_Trafficking_Resolution.pdf.

⁴⁰ See Association of Southeast Asian Nations, *ASEAN Convention Against Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (2015)*, available at https://asean.org/asean-convention-against-trafficking-in-persons-especially-women-and-children.

⁴¹ See Department of Transportation Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking, *Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector (2019)*, available at https://www.transportation.gov/sites/dot.gov/files/docs/mission/administrations/office-policy/343931/acht-final-report-section-508-compliant.pdf.

⁴² See United States White House. *The National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking (2021)*, available at https://www.whitehouse.gov/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/National-Action-Plan-to-Combat-Human-Trafficking.pdf.

Unsafe Practices Associated with the Trafficking, Smuggling or Transport of Migrants by Sea;⁴³ ICAO's Circular 352: Guidelines for Training Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons;⁴⁴ ACI's Combatting Human Trafficking Handbook,⁴⁵ IATA's Guidance on Human Trafficking, 46 and USDOT ACHT's Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector.

Transportation ministries, agencies, operators, and organizations can document a zero-tolerance position⁴⁷ on human trafficking of all forms in employee policies. They can also ensure transparency in combating the crime within their businesses and properties, including strong procurement policies and procedures. Such efforts are encouraged through ACI and IATA guidelines. Economy aircraft operators such as Air Canada, 48 Air New Zealand, 49 All Nippon Airways,⁵⁰ Cathay Pacific Airlines,⁵¹ China Airlines,⁵² Delta Air Lines,⁵³ Korean Air,⁵⁴ Latam

⁴³ See International Maritime Organization, Interim Measures for Combating Unsafe Practices Associated with the Trafficking, Smuggling or Transport of Migrants by Sea (2016), available at

https://www.imo.org/en/OurWork/Facilitation/Pages/UnsafeMixedMigration-Default.aspx.

⁴⁴ ICAO Circular 352 recommends arranging counter-trafficking policies under the following categories: a) commitment statement; b) description/definition of trafficking; c) responsibility and authority of flight crew; d) responsibility of cabin crew; e) responsibility of other operator personnel (including third party operating personnel); f) documentation and reporting; and g) training and procedures.

⁴⁵ See Airports Council International, Combatting Human Trafficking Handbook (2019), available at https://store.aci.aero/form/combatting-human-trafficking-handbook.

⁴⁶ See International Air Transport Association, 2018, Guidance on Human Trafficking (2018), available at https://www.iata.org/contentassets/b24797c51f6a4b02a6b9036c49bc0b81/human-trafficking-guidelines-v1.pdf.

⁴⁷ To support the zero-tolerance goal, transportation ministries and operators should work in partnership with suppliers if necessary to resolve potential human trafficking risks.

⁴⁸ See Air Canada, *Modern Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement* (2019), available at https://www.aircanada.com/content/dam/aircanada/portal/documents/PDF/en/Air-Canada-Modern-Slavery-Act-Statement-2016.pdf.

⁴⁹ See Air New Zealand, Modern Slavery Act Statement (2020), available at https://p-airnz.com/cms/assets/PDFs/air-nz-modernslavery-act-statement-2020.pdf.

⁵⁰ See All Nippon Airways, *Human Rights Report 2020 (2020)*, available at https://www.ana.co.jp/group/en/csr/effort/pdf/Human_Rights_Report_2020_e.pdf.

⁵¹ See Cathay Pacific Airlines, Human Rights Policy (2021), available at https://www.cathaypacific.com/content/dam/focalpoint/cx/about-us/responsible-business/Cathay-Pacific-Airways-Limited_Human-Rights-Policy.pdf. ⁵² See China Airlines, *Human Rights Policy* (2021), available at: https://calec.china-

airlines.com/csr/en/download/pages/human_rights_policy.pdf.

⁵³ See Delta, United Nations Association Gives Delta 'Humanitarian of the Year Award" for Work to Fight Trafficking (2020), available at https://news.delta.com/united-nations-association-gives-delta-humanitarian-year-award-work-fight-trafficking.

⁵⁴ See Korean Air, *Modern Slavery Statement (2011)*, available at:

https://www.koreanair.com/content/dam/koreanair/en/footer/terms-and-

policies/documents/Modern%20Slavery%20Act%20Statement_2011.pdf.

Airlines,⁵⁵ Lufthansa,⁵⁶ Malaysia Airlines,⁵⁷Qantas,⁵⁸ Singapore Airlines,⁵⁹ and Thai Airways⁶⁰ have counter-trafficking policies in place that cover several areas, including employee training, employee responsibilities, and supply chains free of human trafficking. Wabtec Australia, a provider of transit and freight rail equipment with subsidiaries in Chile and China, implemented a counter-trafficking policy with clear guidelines prohibiting forced labor in their supply chains, and measurements to assess policy efficacy.⁶¹

Transportation ministry, agency, and operator personnel should be provided with counter-trafficking guidelines and responsibilities regarding reporting suspected instances of human trafficking, as noted in the aforementioned ICAO, ACI, and IATA counter-trafficking guidelines. Employee counter-trafficking policies should also address the prohibition of using organizational resources to support human trafficking-related activities, and prohibiting engagement with businesses that may be connected to human trafficking. Clear guidelines should outline measures that will be taken in response to potential violations.

Along with internal and external counter-trafficking policies, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should have clear reporting protocols in place to guide employees in reporting suspected instances of human trafficking.

3.4 REPORTING PROTOCOLS

Comprehensive counter-trafficking policies include reporting suspected instances of human trafficking to proper authorities, as emphasized in the 2017 APEC Transportation Ministerial declaration, ⁶² ICAO Circular 357 on *Guidelines for Reporting Trafficking in Persons in Aviation*, and other counter-trafficking guidelines by international transport-specific associations and economy advisory groups. ⁶³ Reporting protocols should specify detailed reporting guidelines,

⁵⁵ See Latam Airlines Group, *Latam Airlines Integrated Report* (2019), available at http://www.latamairlinesgroup.net/static-files/94a2afb7-7f62-4743-84b0-28048a061d54.

⁵⁶ See Lufthansa, *Modern Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement (2020)*, available at https://www.lufthansatechnik.com/slavery-trafficking.

⁵⁷ See Malaysia Airlines, MAG Pledges to Fight Human Trafficking (2017), available at:

https://www.malaysiaairlines.com/kr/en/news-article/2017/pledges-to-fight-human-and-wildlife-trafficking.html

⁵⁸ See Qantas, *Modern Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement* (2021), available at:

https://www.qantas.com/content/dam/qantas/pdfs/about-us/corporate-governance/modern-slavery-and-human-trafficking-statement.pdf.

⁵⁹ See Singapore Air, *Modern Slavery Statement (2021)*, available at: https://www.singaporeair.com/saar5/pdf/corporate-info/modern-slavery-statement.pdf.

⁶⁰ See Thai Airways International, Anti-Slavery Statement (2019), available at:

https://www.thaiairways.com/static/common/pdf/terms_condition/Anti_Slavery_Statement.pdf.

⁶¹ See Wabtec, Australian Modern Slavery Statement (2021), available at:

https://www.wabteccorp.com/Australian-Modern-Slavery-Statement.pdf.

⁶² See Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, *APEC Transportation Ministerial Meeting (2017)*, available at https://www.apec.org/meeting-papers/sectoral-ministerial-meetings/transportation/2017_transport.

⁶³ See the Airports Council International 2019 *Combatting Human Trafficking Handbook*, the International Air Transport Association 2018 *Guidance on Human Trafficking*, and the USDOT Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking 2019 *Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector* report.

avoid causing potential harm to employees and victims, ⁶⁴ and provide victim-centered, trauma-informed human trafficking hotline and law enforcement points of contact.

In reporting suspected instances of human trafficking, public-facing transport personnel (such as airplane cabin crew, airport and port counter agents, bus and truck drivers, rail ticket inspectors, and taxi drivers, among others) can provide key information, with anonymous reporting options, to victim-centered, trauma-informed human trafficking hotlines and law enforcement. A standardized reporting chain and corresponding procedures can be employed to connect transport personnel with the appropriate authorities.

For the aviation sector, the International Federation of Air Line Pilots' Associations (IFALPA),⁶⁵ IATA, and the United States' Blue Lightning Initiative (BLI) stress the importance of "real-time" reporting mechanisms through varied air-to-ground communications systems and reporting procedures. BLI trains aviation personnel to recognize and report potential instances of human trafficking on the ground and in flight, providing law enforcement with additional time to conduct research, analyze information, and coordinate an appropriate and effective victim-centered and trauma-informed response.⁶⁶

In addition to implementing clear reporting protocols, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should collaborate with public and private partners in implementing counter-trafficking training for their employees.

3.5 Training

When frontline transportation personnel are trained to recognize and respond to suspected human trafficking, actionable tips can be provided to victim-centered and trauma-informed hotlines and law enforcement. The 2017 APEC Transportation Ministerial declaration highlighted the importance of counter-trafficking training for transportation ministries, transportation service providers, and the public.⁶⁷

Implementation of training programs, with proper oversight, should address the definition of human trafficking, various forms of the crime, transport-specific indicators, why trafficking occurs, applicable laws, appropriate reporting channels, and success stories. Training programs

⁶⁴ ICAO Circular 352 on "Guidelines for Training Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons" emphasizes the importance of "Do No Harm" to ensure that potential victims are not further jeopardized, and to ensure the safety of fellow aviation personnel and members of the traveling public. The concept of "Do No Harm" encompasses not confronting suspected traffickers, not attempting to rescue suspected victims, acting normally to avoid displaying unusual concern or alarm, and being discreet when reporting information so as not to raise suspicion.

⁶⁵ See International Federation of Air Line Pilots' Associations, *Combatting Human Trafficking in Aviation (2019)*, available at https://www.ifalpa.org/media/3483/19pos12-combatting-human-trafficking-in-aviation.pdf.

⁶⁶ See United States Department of Transportation, *Blue Lightning Initiative*, available at https://www.transportation.gov/administrations/office-policy/blue-lightning-initiative.

⁶⁷ See Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation, *Transportation Ministerial Statement* (2017), available at https://www.apec.org/meeting-papers/sectoral-ministerial-meetings/transportation/2017_transport. See Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation, *Transportation Ministerial Statement* (2017), available at https://www.apec.org/meeting-papers/sectoral-ministerial-meetings/transportation/2017_transport.

should comply with relevant national measures and international guidelines, and can be mandated for orientation of new employees as well as annually for all public-facing personnel.

For the aviation sector, ICAO provides States and operators with a training framework for human trafficking detection and reporting, with a particular emphasis on the role of cabin crew members. ICAO's 2020 *Tool for Capacity Building of Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons* training program⁶⁸ was developed in cooperation with the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights. The course increases understanding of human trafficking, and trains aviation personnel to identify and respond to potential instances. The training includes the elements of human trafficking, potential vulnerabilities, current efforts to combat human trafficking, how to report suspected occurrences, and video interviews of airlines with established counter-trafficking trainings. ICAO, ACI, IATA, and USDOT ACHT guidelines include aviation-specific indicators of human trafficking in addition to key areas counter-trafficking trainings should address.

ACI's e-learning course addresses the role that airports can play in combating human trafficking in addition to highlighting effective policies, indicators, employee training, public awareness measures, and case studies. Through the United States' BLI training, approximately 90 aviation partners have trained over 200,000 public facing aviation personnel to recognize and report potential instances of human trafficking. The BLI interactive video training module outlines common indicators of human trafficking that aviation personnel may encounter, and includes supplemental materials such as an indicator card for aviation personnel to easily reference, a public awareness poster for employee break rooms, and a pocket guide.

Aircraft operator counter-trafficking training efforts include the AirAsia Foundation training nearly 1,600 AirAsia cabin crew staff and other personnel as first responders in the fight against human trafficking;⁷¹ Air New Zealand training all their employees annually with a targeted training for cabin crew and pilots,⁷² All Nippon Airways training 94 percent of its employees through an e-learning program that remains compulsory for all new cabin attendants,⁷³ Delta Air Lines training over 66,000 employees to recognize and respond to human trafficking,⁷⁴and Lufthansa

_

⁶⁸ See International Civil Aviation Organization, *Tool for Capacity Building of Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons* (2020), available at https://www.icao.int/safety/airnavigation/OPS/CabinSafety/Pages/Trafficking-in-Persons.aspx#:∼:text=The%20tool%20for%20capacity%20building,operators%2C%20that%20enables%20trainees%20to%3A&t ext=Identify%20potential%20cases%20of%20trafficking%20in%20persons.

⁶⁹ See Airports Council International, *Combatting Human Trafficking (2020)*, available at https://www.olc.aero/product/combatting-human-trafficking.

See Section 3.1 for U.S. laws requiring frontline aviation employees to be trained to recognize and report human trafficking.
 Yap, Mun Ching, "AirAsia's Know the Signs Initiative" (presentation, APEC/USDOT Modal Strategies for Combating Human

Trafficking in Transportation virtual event, Washington, DC, October 20, 2020).

⁷² See Air New Zealand, *Modern Slavery Act Statement* (2020), available at https://p-airnz.com/cms/assets/PDFs/air-nz-modern-slavery-act-statement-2020.pdf.

⁷³ See All Nippon Airways, *Human Rights Report* (2020), available at https://www.ana.co.jp/group/en/csr/effort/pdf/Human_Rights_Report_2020_e.pdf.

⁷⁴ See Delta, *United Nations Association Gives Delta 'Humanitarian of the Year Award" for Work to Fight Trafficking (2019)*, available at https://news.delta.com/united-nations-association-gives-delta-humanitarian-year-award-work-fight-trafficking.

providing training to pilots and flight attendants.⁷⁵ Japanese authorities established a consultative mechanism with Japan's aviation industry to train flight attendants on victim identification and referral to law enforcement.⁷⁶ Singapore's human trafficking task force partnered with the Civil Aviation Society of Singapore to train airline service workers on trafficking awareness and detection, and provided trafficking training materials.⁷⁷ Airport counter-trafficking training efforts include Canada's Edmonton International Airport providing airport employees with training,⁷⁸Houston Airport System training 2,800 regular and contract employees in cooperation with local and federal law enforcement,⁷⁹ San Francisco Airport conducting training for customerfacing employees,⁸⁰ and Narita Airport providing counter-trafficking training to staff members.⁸¹

Regionally, the Bali Process on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime (Bali Process) provides land, air, and sea counter-trafficking training in several economies, most recently in 2021 for maritime border officials in Thailand and Brunei. Bru

A few NGOs provide sector-specific counter-trafficking training resources for the transport sector. Truckers Against Trafficking provides trainings for trucking personnel, 87 school bus

⁷⁵ See Lufthansa, *Modern Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement* (2020), available at https://www.lufthansatechnik.com/slavery-trafficking.

 $^{^{76}}$ See United States Department of State, $Trafficking\ in\ Persons\ Report\ (2020),\ available\ at\ https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.$

⁷⁷ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

⁷⁸ See Edmonton International Airport, *Human Trafficking Training Resources* (2021), available at https://flyeia.com/human-trafficking-tra sources.

⁷⁹ Abashawl, Saba, "Houston Airport Systems" (presentation, USDOT Combating Human Trafficking in Transportation virtual event, Washington, DC, December 8, 2020).

⁸⁰ See San Francisco Airport. Stop Human Trafficking, available at https://www.flysfo.com/community/stop-human-trafficking.

⁸¹ See Airports Council International, *Narita Airport Continues Campaign to Address Human Trafficking (2019)*, available at https://www.aci-asiapac.aero/media-centre/news/narita-airport-continues-campaign-to-address-human-trafficking

⁸² Irwin, Ryan, "Overview of the Regional Support Office of the Bali Process" (presentation, APEC/USDOT Combating Human Trafficking Across the Transportation Sector virtual workshop, Washington, DC, December 14, 2021).

⁸³ See Reuters, *Asia Ride Hailing Giant Trains Driver to Fight Human Trafficking (2019)*, available at: https://www.reuters.com/article/us-asia-trafficking-transportation/asia-ride-hailing-giant-trains-drivers-to-fight-human-trafficking-idUSKBN1OS1E1.

⁸⁴ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2021)*, available at: https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/TIP_Report_Final_20210701.pdf.

⁸⁵ See Uber, *Spreading Education and Awareness to Help Fight Human Trafficking (2021)*, https://www.uber.com/newsroom/spreading-awareness-to-help-fight-human-trafficking.

⁸⁶ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2021)*, available at: https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/TIP_Report_Final_20210701.pdf.

⁸⁷ See Truckers Against Trafficking, *Truckers Against Trafficking Training Video*, available at https://vimeo.com/399290663?embedded=true&source=vimeo_logo&owner=63594831.

personnel,⁸⁸transit and commercial bus personnel,⁸⁹ civil transportation authorities,⁹⁰ and law enforcement⁹¹ in a few languages. BEST provides a training for the ports and maritime sectors.⁹²

Transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should also develop public and private partnerships to bolster their efforts to combat human trafficking in the transport sector.

-

⁸⁸ See Busing on the Lookout, School Transportation Training Video, available at https://vimeo.com/491821011.

⁸⁹ See Busing on the Lookout, *Training Video*, available at https://vimeo.com/249430212.

⁹⁰ See Truckers Against Trafficking, *Combating Human Trafficking Through Your Agency*, available at https://vimeo.com/333479489.

⁹¹ See Truckers Against Trafficking, *Law Enforcement Training*, available at https://vimeo.com/210270400.

⁹² See Businesses Ending Slavery and Trafficking, *Maritime Training: Ports to Freedom*, available at https://www.bestalliance.org/maritime.html.

3.6 PARTNERSHIPS

Public and private partnerships and taskforces among transportation ministries, agencies, and operators, law enforcement, and NGOs support victim-centered and trauma-informed responses to suspected instances of human trafficking. As noted in the Executive Summary, law enforcement officers who are trained to be victim-centered and trauma-informed are uniquely positioned to respond to human trafficking by identifying indicators and responding with an informed approach that is protective of potential victims and reporting individuals. Such training can provide law enforcement officers with a more nuanced and holistic understanding of how to interpret and assess avoidant or seemingly combative responses from victims who have been groomed to be distrustful and fearful of all law enforcement. NGOs can run human trafficking hotlines and provide emergency, transitional, and long-term services to victims and survivors of human trafficking, including crisis intervention, counseling, legal services, shelter and housing, health services, education, employment services, vocational training, and transportation assistance. They can also provide comprehensive victim services, including supporting victim and survivor safety, independence, wellbeing, and financial security.

Effective partnerships can leverage engagements with diverse organizations possessing complementary and reinforcing strengths within different jurisdictions, allowing each partner to focus on central capacities and assets to produce outcomes with greater impact than can be achieved independently. Partnering with NGOs and prosecutors, in addition to other public and private entities, further supports a comprehensive approach by law enforcement as they share information and best practices. Such partnerships facilitate open communication channels for potential human trafficking reports, and can help to ensure victim-centered and trauma-informed action is taken when potential victims are identified. Such services enable victims to safely seek assistance from law enforcement, and to serve as witnesses for counter-trafficking investigations and prosecutions.

Most APEC economies are members of the Bali Process, which raises regional awareness regarding the consequences of human trafficking, and provides counter-trafficking training and resources for land, air, and sea stakeholders. Malaysia's Minister of Transport is among the cabinet members of the interagency Council for Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants, which formulates policies, and programs to raise awareness and combat human trafficking throughout the economy. The Department of Justice in the Philippines oversaw and supported operations and training for 24 interagency anti-trafficking task forces, including six air and seaport task forces and a task force at Manila's international airport. The international NGO

_

⁹³ See The Bali Process, About the Bali Process (2021), available at https://www.baliprocess.net.

⁹⁴ See Tools for Transformation, *Malaysia Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act* (2007), available at https://toolsfortransformation.net/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/Malaysian-Law-Anti-Trafficking-in-Person-Smuggling-of-Migrants-ATIPSOM-2.pdf.

⁹⁵ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

Truckers Against Trafficking partnered with public and private stakeholders across the United States, Canada, and Mexico to provide training and awareness for the trucking, bus, and taxi sectors.⁹⁶

The USDOT ACHT recommends partnering with public and private entities, including industry, labor, law enforcement, and NGOs, to maximize their collective impact in combating human trafficking across all modes of transportation. In the United States, nearly 550 transportation stakeholders have committed to train their employees, raise awareness among the traveling public, and measure and share human trafficking-related data in signing the USDOT Transportation Leaders Against Human Trafficking (TLAHT) pledge. The USDOT and U.S. Department of Homeland Security's (USDHS) BLI has 90 aviation partners (including aircraft operators and airports) that have trained public facing aviation personnel to recognize human trafficking and report potential instances to appropriate law enforcement, and is expanding to include international air carriers that fly to the United States. Page 1981.

Partnerships between transportation organizations and law enforcement have resulted in successfully preventing human trafficking, such as a 2020 Interpol operation that targeted the crime across 4 economies by concentrating on ports and transit points. The operation resulted in the rescue of 82 victims and over 180 arrests. Through access to INTERPOL's global databases, frontline authorities in participating economies ran more than 13,000 checks on travel documents and other data to help identify potential traffickers and their victims.⁹⁹

ICAO, ACI, IATA, and USDOT ACHT guidelines recommend such collaboration with law enforcement agencies to assist them in detecting and disrupting potential instances of human trafficking. In Japan, in preparation for the Tokyo 2020 Olympic and Paralympic Games, Narita Airport co-sponsored a seminar on human trafficking with All Nippon Airways in partnership with the National Police Agency and the International Organization for Migration. ¹⁰⁰

In addition to developing partnerships, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should raise public awareness among the traveling public.

3.7 Public Awareness

Transportation ministries, agencies, and operators can help to prevent human trafficking by raising awareness among passengers to increase the traveling public's understanding of human trafficking indicators and how to report suspected instances. Effective measures include press conferences,

at https://www.transportation.gov/administrations/office-policy/blue-lightning-initiative.

99 See Interpol. *Hundreds Arrested in Crackdown on Terrorist Routes in Southeast Asia (2020)*, available

⁹⁶ See Truckers Against Trafficking, *Model Replication*, available at https://truckersagainsttrafficking.org/model-replication.

⁹⁷ See United States Department of Transportation, *Transportation Leaders Against Human Trafficking*, available at https://www.transportation.gov/TLAHT.

⁹⁸ See United States Department of Transportation, *Blue Lightning Initiative (2021)*, available

at https://www.interpol.int/News-and-Events/News/2020/Hundreds-arrested-in-crackdown-on-terrorist-routes-in-Southeast-Asia. 100 See Airports Council International, *Narita Airport Continues Campaign to Address Human Trafficking (2019)*, available at https://www.aci-asiapac.aero/media-centre/news/narita-airport-continues-campaign-to-address-human-trafficking.

press releases, videos, signage, exhibitions, public awareness posters, flyers, wallet cards, public service announcements, blogs, social media, and email messages. Victim facing materials should include victim-centered and trauma-informed human trafficking hotline and law enforcement phone numbers and can be placed in airports, airplanes, buses, trains, bus and train stations, ships, ports, truck stops, rest areas, taxis, rideshares, limousines, building entrances and exits, ground transportation pick up spots, smoking areas, in-flight magazines, and other transportation-related public facing periodicals for passengers. In addition, public restrooms are often the sole location in which victims may not be in the vicinity of their trafficker, and provide excellent opportunities for transportation ministries, agencies, and operators to raise awareness through public awareness posters. When applicable, public awareness materials can highlight anonymous reporting, to address the fears of victims who have been groomed by traffickers to fear law consequences when they report a tip.

In addition to reporting information, awareness materials should at a minimum address both labor and sex trafficking. The inclusion of transport-specific indicators of human trafficking also provide helpful reminders for transportation personnel, passengers, and victims who may not identify themselves as victims of human trafficking.¹⁰¹ Panic buttons are also useful for potential victims to press to immediately notify victim-centered and trauma-informed security that they need assistance.

From 2017 to 2018, the United States facilitated a self-funded counter-trafficking project that was co-sponsored by Australia, Thailand, and Viet Nam to increase awareness regarding human trafficking in volunteer economies in concert with transport ministries. Conducted in collaboration with the international NGO A21, the project garnered over 30 million public impressions in major transportation hubs across Thailand.

For the aviation sector, ICAO's counter-trafficking training is supplemented by a public awareness video that includes an interview with a survivor. IATA's *Eyes Open* public awareness campaign includes a video that facilitates discussions between passengers, airlines, and government. ¹⁰³ In Australia, Sydney International Airport partnered with the Australian Federal Police and an NGO to share awareness materials in domestic and international terminal bathrooms. ¹⁰⁴ Canada's Calgary and Edmonton international airports partnered with an NGO to raise awareness among

⁻

¹⁰¹ See Appendix 5.2: Modal Indicators for examples.

¹⁰² See Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation, Putting the Brakes on Human Trafficking: Integrating APEC Ministries of Transport into Economies' Domestic and Regional Efforts to Combat Human Trafficking (2017), available at https://aimp2.apec.org/sites/PDB/Lists/Proposals/DispForm.aspx?ID=2003.

¹⁰³ See International Air Transport Association. *Human Trafficking*, available at https://www.iata.org/en/policy/consumer-pax-rights/human-trafficking.

¹⁰⁴ See Sydney Airport, *UN Sustainable Development Goals* (2020), available at https://www.sydneyairport.com.au/corporate/sustainability/annual-performance/our-contribution-to-the-un-sustainable-development-goals.

passengers.¹⁰⁵ In Japan, Narita Airport raising awareness through leaflets and public awareness posters throughout airport premises.¹⁰⁶ Korea publicized the illegality of child sex tourism in airports to reduce the demand for commercial sex acts.¹⁰⁷ Malaysian labor officials provided banners and other signage at the Kuala Lumpur International Airport in holding lounges for newly arrived migrant workers in a range of languages to help educate foreign workers about their rights in Malaysia.¹⁰⁸ The International Organization for Migration Peru partnered with other federal agencies to conduct a passenger awareness campaign at Jorge Chávez International Airport.¹⁰⁹

The Thai government displayed a video in four languages advocating against child sex tourism in Thai airports and on Thai airline flights to reduce the demand for commercial sex acts. ¹¹⁰ In the United States, counter-trafficking public awareness efforts include Delta Air Lines providing a dramatized in-flight video for passengers of a trafficked child. ¹¹¹ USDOT co-branded and facilitated the placement of public awareness campaigns by NGO partner A21 in Dallas Fort Worth, O'Hare, JFK, LaGuardia, and Dulles airports. ¹¹² The Seattle Tacoma International Airport and Hartsfield-Jackson Atlanta International Airport partnered with NGOs to develop employee training and conduct public awareness campaigns for aviation employees and travelers. ¹¹³ The Houston Airport System countertrafficking program also includes partnerships with numerous NGOs to raise awareness throughout their airports using public service announcements. ¹¹⁴

Additional multimodal and mode-specific economy efforts to raise awareness in the transportation sector include Public Safety Canada funding an awareness campaign for truck drivers and truck stops, ¹¹⁵ and the Women's Trucking Federation of Canada displaying a moving truck billboard for the traveling public. ¹¹⁶ In Canada and the United States, rideshare company Uber partnered with

¹⁰⁵ See Edmonton International Airport, Edmonton International Airport Partners With Paul Brandt's #NotInMyCity Campaign to Support a Future Without Human Trafficking (2019), available at https://flyeia.com/corporate/media/news/edmonton-international-airport-partners-paul-brandts-notinmycity-campaign-support-future.

¹⁰⁶ See Airports Council International, *Narita Airport Continues Campaign to Address Human Trafficking (2019)*, available at https://www.aci-asiapac.aero/media-centre/news/narita-airport-continues-campaign-to-address-human-trafficking.

¹⁰⁷ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

¹⁰⁸ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

¹⁰⁹ See United Nations Office of Migration, *Information Campaign Launched to Combat Human Trafficking in Peru* (2013), available at https://www.iom.int/news/information-campaign-launched-combat-human-trafficking-peru.

¹¹⁰ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

¹¹¹ See Delta, Stop Human Trafficking, available at https://www.delta.com/us/en/about-delta/stop-human-trafficking.

¹¹² See U.S. Department of Transportation, *Budget Highlights* 2020 (2020), available at

https://www.transportation.gov/sites/dot.gov/files/docs/mission/budget/333126/budgethighlightsfinal 040519.pdf.

¹¹³ See Airports Council International, *Combatting Human Trafficking Handbook (2019)*, available at https://store.aci.aero/form/combatting-human-trafficking-handbook.

¹¹⁴ See Abashawl, Saba, "Houston Airport Systems" (presentation, USDOT Combating Human Trafficking in Transportation virtual event, Washington, DC, December 8, 2020).

¹¹⁵ See Public Safety Canada, *National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking (2018)*, available at https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrcs/pblctns/ntnl-ctn-pln-cmbt/index-en.aspx.

¹¹⁶ See Women's Trucking Federation of Canada, *The Role of the Transportation Sector in the Fight Against Human Trafficking in Canada (2019)*, https://www.canadiancentretoendhumantrafficking.ca/the-role-of-the-transportation-sector-in-the-fight-against-human-trafficking-in-canada.

NGOs to develop resources and a podcast for drivers and the general public.¹¹⁷ Chinese Taipei provided counter-trafficking materials to air carriers, railways, and major taxi operators that could be involved in human trafficking.¹¹⁸

Sector-specific counter-trafficking public awareness resources for the transport sector include materials for school, commercial, and transit buses from Busing on the Lookout; ¹¹⁹posters, brochures, and wallet cards from Truckers Against Trafficking; ¹²⁰ multimodal videos and posters from The A21 Campaign; ¹²¹and multimodal posters and graphics from USDOT's Transportation Leaders Against Human Trafficking. ¹²²

In addition to raising public awareness among the traveling public, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should support data collection and information-sharing efforts regarding the intersection of human trafficking and transportation.

3.8 Data Collection and Information-Sharing

In addition to reporting to victim-centered and trauma-informed law enforcement and human trafficking hotlines, data collection and information-sharing can help enhance the limited statistics available regarding the intersection of human trafficking and transportation. Transportation operators can track reports of human trafficking made by employees and members of the traveling public, and share them with transportation ministries. Collectively, these reports can help to identify intersections between transportation employees, trafficking victims, and traffickers; transport-specific indicators of human trafficking; and trafficking routes, hotspots, and patterns within and between economies. Transportation policymakers and stakeholders armed with this knowledge are better equipped to determine when and where to allocate resources, enable key strategic counter-trafficking initiatives, and focus intervention efforts. Transportation stakeholders can also draw upon the data to bolster counter-trafficking strategies, awareness trainings, public awareness campaigns, and other targeted initiatives.

For the aviation sector, ICAO encourages documenting cases reported by cabin crew members, without attribution, to track trends at the operator level and to assist law enforcement. Switzerland passed legislation in 2018 requiring aircraft operators to cooperate with authorities

¹¹⁷ See Canadian Centre to End Human Trafficking, The Centre Teams Up With Uber Canada (2019),

https://www.canadiancentretoendhumantrafficking.ca/the-centre-teams-up-with-uber-canada-press-release.

¹¹⁸ See Chinese Taipei, 2021-2022 Anti-Exploitation Action Plan (2021), available at https://www.immigration.gov.tw/5475/5478/6928/6934.

¹¹⁹ See Truckers Against Trafficking, Request our Materials, available at https://truckersagainsttrafficking.org/get-our-materials.

¹²⁰ See Truckers Against Trafficking, *Request our Materials*, available at https://truckersagainsttrafficking.org/get-our-materials.

¹²¹ See A21, Can You See Me? Campaign, available at https://www.a21.org/content/can-you-see-me/grbis0?permcode=grbis0.

¹²² See United States Department of Transportation, *Posters*, available

at https://www.transportation.gov/TLAHT/Posters. USDOT public awareness materials are being expanded to cover all modes of transportation.

¹²³ See International Civil Aviation Organization, Circular 352: Guidelines for Training Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons (2018), available at

https://www.icao.int/safety/airnavigation/OPS/CabinSafety/Documents/Cir.352.all text.en.pdf.

regarding suspected criminal offences by transferring relevant passenger data. ¹²⁴ In the United States, the *Frederick Douglass Trafficking Victims Prevention and Protection Reauthorization Act of 2018* requires certain air carriers to track the number of personnel trained to recognize and report human trafficking, the number of notifications received from staff and passengers, and whether the air carrier notified the National Human Trafficking Hotline or law enforcement at the relevant airport. ¹²⁵

In Japan, the Immigration Services Agency tracks passenger and biometric data to prevent human trafficking through immigration control at air and sea ports of entry. ¹²⁶ The Malaysian ACTIP, which includes the Minister of Transport, collects data and authorizes research on the prevention and suppression of human trafficking. ¹²⁷ In the United States, the forthcoming National Outreach Survey for Transportation of transportation stakeholders, trafficking survivors, and service providers was conducted by the NGO United Against Slavery and funded in part by USDOT through the Department's *Combating Human Trafficking in Transportation Impact Award*. Findings will include an analysis of which transportation modes are used during recruitment, exploitation, extraction or escape, and as survivors heal. ¹²⁸

In addition to efforts to bolster data collection and information-sharing on the intersection of human trafficking and transportation, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators should provide victim and survivor support.

3.9 VICTIM AND SURVIVOR SUPPORT

Victims and survivors of human trafficking have experienced severe trauma, been deprived of basic human rights and opportunities, and require support to rebuild their lives. Transportation ministries, agencies, and operators can support victims by providing awareness materials tailored for victims in discrete locations, such as toilet booths, and at locations where interactions with authorities occur. Distribution of survivor-informed awareness materials should address sex and labor trafficking, and include human trafficking indicators and reporting guidance. Transport operators can support survivors by donating travel vouchers to non-governmental countertrafficking support organizations to help victims leave their trafficking situation as well as access social, legal, and medical services in addition to employment. An appeal process can be instituted by transport operators for transport-related debts and fines that victims and survivors may have been forced to accrue by their traffickers or incurred when escaping their exploitation. Transport

¹²⁴ See United Nations International Organization for Migration, Swiss Confederation. 2018. Conclusions of the International Round Table "How Can Aviation Contribute to Combatting Human Trafficking?" *Unpublished document*. Geneva: IOM. ¹²⁵ See United States of America, *Frederick Douglass Trafficking Victims Prevention and Protection Reauthorization Act of 2018, Public Law 115-425 [H.R. 22000] (2018)*, available at https://www.congress.gov/bill/115th-congress/house-bill/2200. ¹²⁶ See Council for the Promotion of Measures to Combat Trafficking in Persons, *Measures to Combat Trafficking in Persons (2019)*, available at: https://www.kantei.go.jp/jp/singi/jinsintorihiki/dai5/eigoban.pdf.

¹²⁷ See Laws of Malaysia, *Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Act (2007)*. Available at https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/docs/ELECTRONIC/79357/124976/F-1905028907/MYS79357%202011.pdf.

¹²⁸See United Against Slavery, *National Outreach Survey for Transportation*, available at https://www.unitedagainstslavery.org/impact-award-team.html.

operators can also offer passengers an opportunity to round up their payments in support of donations to non-governmental counter-trafficking support organizations. Additionally, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators can provide workforce development and employment opportunities for survivors.

Australia's Sydney Airport partnered with the Sydney Community Foundation to raise \$170,000 for local charities whose work includes helping sex trafficking survivors.¹²⁹ The International Organization for Migration Peru covers airfare to reunite survivors with their family members.¹³⁰ The U.S. Department of Justice supports survivors with emergency needs when other resources are not available, including covering transportation costs.¹³¹ In the Philippines, the government constructed a temporary shelter and one-stop center near a regional international airport with comprehensive care for trafficking victims, including airport assistance and transportation assistance.¹³² Members of the Philippines Interagency Council Against Trafficking Secretariat met arriving repatriation flights to coordinate individualized assistance for 1,143 trafficking victims.¹³³ Delta Air Lines offered survivor apprenticeships to support professional development and provide career re-entry skills, donated over 6 million frequent flyer miles for over 100 flights for trafficking survivors to return to safety or receive critical services, contributed \$2.5 million toward the National Human Trafficking Hotline; and provides volunteer opportunities in 16 cities for employees to give time and service to counter-trafficking organizations in local communities.¹³⁴

Beyond strategic placement of law enforcement and public awareness materials, travel vouchers, and employment opportunities, transportation ministries, agencies, and operators can also partner with NGOs to consider additional victim and survivor support initiatives tailored for their region.

4. CONCLUSION

In accordance with the APEC TPTWG 2013 and 2017 Ministerial statements, this report addresses combating human trafficking in the transportation sector by raising awareness regarding the crime among transportation ministries and agencies, transportation service providers, and the traveling public to deter traffickers, save lives, halt illicit economic activity, and help report instances of human trafficking to the proper law enforcement authorities. As laid out in this strategy, elements

¹²⁹ See Sydney Airport, *Sydney Airport and Sydney Community Foundation launch 2019 Bid for Good campaign (2019)*, available at https://www.sydneyairport.com.au/corporate/media/corporate-newsroom/sydney-airport-and-sydney-community-foundation-launch-2019-bid-for-good.

¹³⁰ See IOM Peru, *Information Campaign Launched to Combat Human Trafficking in Peru (2021)*, available at: https://www.iom.int/news/information-campaign-launched-combat-human-trafficking-peru.

¹³¹ Health and Human Services, *Services Available To Victims of Human Trafficking* (2012), available at: https://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/documents/orr/traffickingservices_0.pdf

¹³² See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

¹³³ See United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report (2020)*, available at https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/2020-TIP-Report-Complete-062420-FINAL.pdf.

¹³⁴ See Delta, *United Nations Association Gives Delta 'Humanitarian of the Year Award" for Work to Fight Trafficking (2019)*, available at https://news.delta.com/united-nations-association-gives-delta-humanitarian-year-award-work-fight-trafficking.

for a comprehensive approach include human trafficking laws, leadership, policies, reporting protocols, partnerships, training, public awareness, data collection and information-sharing, and victim and survivor support. These elements are outlined as recommendations in the Executive Summary of this report. The model comprehensive counter-trafficking strategy, model proclamation, and model public leadership statement in the appendices also provide transportation ministries, agencies, and operators with further tools to begin or expand implementation.

Collectively implemented, the recommendations laid out in the Executive Summary can foster increased collaboration between public and private transportation stakeholders, and expanded safety on transportation systems within and across APEC economies.

5. APPENDICES

5.1 MODEL TOOLS

5.1.1 COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY

The following model counter-trafficking comprehensive strategy was created as a tool for transportation ministries, agencies, and operators to adapt and implement.¹³⁵ The strategy includes a definition of human trafficking, leadership and funding, partnerships, legal compliance, social responsibility, employee responsibilities and reporting protocols, education and training, public awareness and outreach, data collection and information-sharing, and victim and survivor support.

[ORGANIZATION NAME] COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY TO COMBAT HUMAN TRAFFICKING [Date]

[Organization Name] condemns all forms of human trafficking, fully supports the elimination of the exploitation of human beings, and has published an organizational statement against human trafficking. [Organization Name] will not condone human trafficking in any part of our organization, and our policies and procedures reflect a strong commitment to upholding the belief that every person has the right to safety and security.

The United Nations "Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children" ¹³⁷ (also known as the Palermo Protocol) defines human trafficking as:

- (a) "Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;
- (b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used;
- (c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered "trafficking in persons" even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article;
- (d) "Child" shall mean any person under eighteen years of age.

¹³⁵ Adapted from the USDOT ACHT's 2019 "Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector" report, and ICAO Circular 352 "Guidelines for Training Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons."

¹³⁶ See Appendix 5.1.2 and 5.1.3 for a model counter-trafficking Proclamation and Public Leadership Statement.

¹³⁷ See United Nations General Assembly, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (2000)*, available at https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=XVIII-12-a&chapter=18&lang=en

LEADERSHIP AND FUNDING

[Organization Name's] leadership endorses and supports the counter-human trafficking policies and initiatives below, including assigning the necessary funds to support their implementation.

PARTNERSHIPS

[Organization Name] joins with our partners across the transportation sector to stop human trafficking through leadership, education and training, policy implementation, public awareness and outreach, data collection, information-sharing, and victim and survivor support. [Organization Name] leverages existing resources and partnerships both to reduce duplication and to maximize the collective impact of counter-human trafficking efforts by transportation sector stakeholders.

LEGAL COMPLIANCE

[Organization Name] strictly complies with all applicable laws and regulations regarding the prevention of human trafficking, and cooperates with law enforcement authorities to address instances of human trafficking which the [Organization Name] or its employees have witnessed or become a party to.

SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY

[Organization Name] has zero-tolerance for human trafficking. We are committed to acting ethically within our business dealings and ensuring that human trafficking is not tolerated in our organization or supply chains, and expect our partners, contractors, and suppliers to uphold the same standards. We also commit to helping to reduce the probability that our assets/properties will be used as a transit point for traffickers and their victims.

EMPLOYEE RESPONSIBILITIES

Employees must be vigilant and immediately report, as appropriate, all situations that come to their attention within [Organization Name] premises or businesses where human trafficking and/or exploitation is suspected or appears to be intended. Under no circumstances may the [Organization Name's] funds, property or personnel be used to further or support activities that participate in human trafficking and/or human exploitation. This includes [Organization Name] vehicles, buildings, facilities, parking lots, grounds, technology, equipment, computers, storage devices, software, websites, social media channels, networks, phones (including cell phones), funds (including company credit cards and expense accounts), and [Organization Name]-funded hotel rooms, goods, and services.

No employee may:

- Use or allow the use of any of the [Organization Name's] facilities, resources or equipment to support human trafficking and/or the exploitation of human beings.
- Use any [Organization Name] resources, including credit cards and expense accounts, to buy sex.

- Create, download, view, store, copy, or transmit content that is sexually explicit or sexuallyoriented, during work hours, while traveling on business, while engaged in any work-related activities, or using [Organization Name] resources.
- View/search online advertisements for commercial sex during work hours, while working on company business, while engaged in any work-related activities, or using [Organization Name] resources.
- View/search websites where adult entertainment is offered for sale during work hours, while working on company business, while engaged in any work- related activities, or using [Organization Name] resources.
- Enter into, on behalf of [Organization Name] or otherwise, any business relationships or any other arrangement with any organization which the employee has reason to believe participates in any way in human trafficking or the exploitation of human beings.

Employees who violate this policy may be subject to disciplinary action, up to and including termination. All employees have a responsibility for ensuring that this policy is followed. Concerns and potential violations should be reported to the [Organization Name] POC. [Organization Name] strictly prohibits retaliation against any employee for making a good faith report of any potential or suspected violation of this policy, or for cooperating in any investigation of such violation.

EMPLOYEE REPORTING PROTOCOL - SUSPECTED HUMAN TRAFFICKING

- When dealing with suspected cases of human trafficking, make every effort to avoid causing harm to yourself or to the possible victim.
- Do not confront the trafficker.
- Do not attempt to rescue the victim.
- Assess the situation and if indicators are present: act natural, do not display unusual concern or alarm, do not probe, do not intervene.
- Employees should avoid becoming directly involved in a suspected human trafficking situation. ¹³⁸
- Leave and go to a safe place to contact [insert victim-centered, trauma-informed reporting protocol point of contact]. If you suspect there is a threat of immediate harm to a suspected victim, call [insert Member State emergency victim-centered and trauma-informed law enforcement number].
- [For in-flight employees] Report your concerns to [insert aircraft operator victim-centered and trauma-informed reporting protocol point of contact].
- If there is no immediate danger to suspected victims, call [insert APEC economy victim-centered and trauma-informed human trafficking hotline, if available].

¹³⁸ To avoid causing harm to potential victims or themselves, employees are recommended to report suspected instances of human trafficking to trained law enforcement rather than engaging directly with potential victims or traffickers.

- Make note of the date and time of the suspected incident, description of those involved (include tattoos, physical identifiers, hair color, approximate age, etc.), any names or nicknames overheard, a summary of the situation that prompted the report, and their vehicle number and destination.
- Share the reporting of your tip with [Organization Name] [point of contact].
- For further questions or information, please contact [Organization Name] [point of contact].

EMPLOYEE REPORTING PROTOCOL – IF APPROACHED BY A VICTIM

- If the victim is in immediate danger, call [insert APEC economy emergency victim-centered and trauma-informed law enforcement number].
- If there is no immediate danger to the victim, call [insert APEC economy victim-centered and trauma-informed human trafficking hotline, if available].
- Ensure that the victim feels safe throughout the process until the appropriate responder arrives.
- Share the reporting of your tip with [Organization Name] [point of contact].
- For further questions or information, please contact [Organization Name] [point of contact].

EDUCATION AND TRAINING

To ensure a high level of understanding of the risks of human trafficking, all employees have been informed of [Organization Name's] expectations regarding human trafficking, and receive initial and annual training.

PUBLIC AWARENESS AND OUTREACH

[Organization Name] raises awareness about human trafficking in areas that are frequented by employees and travelers by conducting and participating in public awareness campaigns. [Organization Name] leverages public touchpoints to spread the counter-human trafficking message.

DATA COLLECTION & INFORMATION-SHARING

[Organization Name] has developed reporting and documentation protocols, and will share any relevant data and case studies gathered annually with [APEC economy Transportation Ministry].

VICTIM AND SURVIVOR SUPPORT

[Organization Name] posts survivor-informed awareness materials for potential victims, donates transportation service vouchers to a victim services organization to support victims in their escape and survivors in their recovery, has established workforce development opportunities for survivors, and established a survivor-informed "second chance" employment program.

5.1.2 PROCLAMATION

Below is a model proclamation that transportation authorities and organizations can adopt to demonstrate their commitment to combating human trafficking. 139

[ORGANIZATION NAME] PROCLAMATION TO COMBAT HUMAN TRAFFICKING [Date]

WHEREAS, Every year, nearly 25 million men, women, and children are trafficked and deprived of their freedom, human rights, and dignity;¹⁴⁰

WHEREAS, Human trafficking includes the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of anyone under the age of 18 for the purpose of exploitation is considered human trafficking under any circumstances;¹⁴¹

WHEREAS, [APEC economy] (if they have done the following) has enacted comprehensive counter-human trafficking laws, with a focus on criminal prosecution and victim support;

WHEREAS, [Organization Name] recognizes the considerable moral and economic harm of human trafficking in our communities and the nation; and recognizes that bringing a greater awareness to this problem will help victims;

WHEREAS, By bringing awareness to human trafficking within the [Organization's Sphere of Influence] sector, we bring the victims hope, and the natural born freedoms all human beings should enjoy;

WHEREAS, [Organization Name] recognizes that increased public awareness and education within our organizations will provide more opportunities to recognize and aid in the fight against human trafficking;

¹³⁹ The development of this proclamation was informed by the USDOT Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking 2019 Report model proclamation.

¹⁴⁰ See International Labour Organization and Walk Free Foundation, *Global Estimates of Modern Slavery: Forced Labour and Forced Marriage* (2017), available at

https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@dgreports/@dcomm/documents/publication/wcms_575479.pdf.

¹⁴¹ See United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (2000)*, available at https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/protocoltraffickinginpersons.aspx

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE ORGANIZATION THAT:

In keeping with our mission, morals and ideals, we pledge to educate all staff, with an emphasis on those who interact with the traveling public, about human trafficking.

[Organization Name] will establish reporting mechanisms through which staff can report human trafficking, and ensure that all employees are trained on the reporting protocol.

[Organization Name] supports increased public awareness, stronger laws, and the promotion of justice to reduce the exploitation of all peoples.

[Organization Name] will track and share key data points with [APEC economy Transportation Ministry] to support measuring the collective impact of transport-related counter-trafficking efforts.

[Organization Name] supports the inclusion of zero-tolerance clauses within procurement contracts with private businesses regarding contractors engaging in any form of human trafficking.

Adopted by [Organization Name] on [Date]

5.1.3 Public Leadership Statement

The model statement below can be used by transportation industry leaders to take a stand against human trafficking as an example for their employees and stakeholders: 142

[ORGANIZATION NAME] PUBLIC LEADERSHIP STATEMENT AGAINST HUMAN TRAFFICKING [Date]

Human trafficking is one of the greatest atrocities of the 21st century. With as many as 24.9 million men, women and children sold into prostitution, domestic servitude or other forced labor in dark corners around the globe, it may seem like a problem beyond our borders. But the truth is, it's happening right here in our communities across [APEC Economy Name].

Those committing this awful crime are using [APEC Economy Name] transportation systems to traffic victims. We cannot allow our transportation systems to be an enabler in such awful acts.

[Organization Name] is joining with our partners across the transportation industry to stop the flow of human trafficking. [Organization Name] is committed not only to preparing our own employees to recognize and report suspected instances, but also to raising awareness among the traveling public. Our message is that human trafficking will not be tolerated.

In addition to joining the transportation sector effort, [Organization Name] is taking the following measures:

- * [Insert activity/commitment]
- * [Insert activity/commitment]

We invite you to join us in the fight to end human trafficking. Learn the basic indicators of human trafficking and be alert when you travel in and around transportation systems. Your simple act of calling in a tip could save lives and help us move closer to a world without human trafficking.

¹⁴² The development of this leadership statement was informed by the USDOT Transportation Leaders Against Human Trafficking 2019 leadership statement.

5.2 MODAL INDICATORS

Human trafficking victims can be of any age, race, gender, sexual orientation, religion, ethnicity, socioeconomic background, or citizenship, and possess any immigration status. The indicators of human trafficking are not motivated by any of these classifications, but rather identify objective signs that may indicate potential criminal activity. While no single indicator can confirm a human trafficking situation, several combined indicators may increase the likelihood that a person is being trafficked, or actively being targeted and recruited. The following indicators ¹⁴³ provide transportation sector employees and the traveling public with guidance regarding potential indicators of human trafficking that they may encounter in and around transportation hubs.

GENERAL

- 1. Appears fearful, anxious, depressed, submissive, tense, timid, or nervous/paranoid.
- 2. Avoids eye contact, interaction with others, or is watchful to the point of paranoia
- 3. Shows signs of malnourishment, poor hygiene, fatigue, sleep deprivation, untreated illness, injuries, and/or unusual behavior.
- 4. Branding tattoo that indicates ownership.
- 5. Wounds, whip marks or bruises at various stages of healing.
- 6. Appears drugged or disoriented.
- 7. Appears to have lost sense of time or location.
- 8. Avoids and distrusts authority figures, including law enforcement, and may be combative.
- 9. Uses prepaid credit cards and gift cards, and may deposit large amounts multiple times in one day.
- 10. Has a language barrier with their travel companion.
- 11. Behavioral dependence on traveling companion such as looking to companion before answering questions, looking down, and fear of companion.
- 12. Exhibits evidence of verbal threats, emotional abuse, and/or being treated in a demeaning way.
- 13. Seems coached when talking to authority or law enforcement.
- 14. Sounds scripted or provides inconsistent stories in contrast with travel companion(s).
- 15. Is threatened with deportation or law enforcement action.
- 16. Lies about identity and/or age.

- 17. May indicate they are being held against their will.
- 18. Signs of criminal indicators present, such as drugs, stolen property, etc.
- 19. Any acknowledgement that they have a pimp or is making a quota.

¹⁴³ Adapted from ICAO Circular 352 "Guidelines for Training Cabin Crew on Identifying and Responding to Trafficking in Persons" and the USDOT Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking "Combating Human Trafficking in the Transportation Sector" 2019 report.

AVIATION PERSONNEL (CHECK-IN, SECURITY, CONCESSIONS, GATE, CABIN)

- 1. Traveling on a last-minute booking paid by someone else in cash.
- 2. Does not know the person who purchased their ticket, who is picking them up, or who is traveling with them.
- 3. Minor does not appear to be accompanied by their legitimate parent or guardian.
- 4. A child/person within a family appearing particularly unkempt and uncared for.
- 5. Is not wearing appropriate clothing or their appearance may not fit the route of travel or weather.
- 6. Traveling with little or no money or personal items, such as luggage or carry-on bags.
- 7. Traveling with minimal personal items but carrying condoms, hotel key cards, gift cards.
- 8. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 9. No control of travel identification or documents or money, or bears false identity or travel documents.
- 10. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking/translating).
- 11. Does not know their home or work address.
- 12. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 13. Has no logical means of reaching, or lacks knowledge of, final destination.
- 14. Traveling to obtain a job with no specific information, such as who will be meeting them.
- 15. May speak of a modeling, acting, dancing, singing, hospitality, or labor job with few details about the position, and without knowing who will meet them upon arrival.
- 16. No freedom of movement or social interaction (e.g., using the lavatory unaccompanied).
- 17. Comes from a location or State known as a source or destination for trafficking in persons. 144

BUS PERSONNEL: SCHOOL

- 1. A child dropping off and picking up children at the bus stop.
- 2. Changes in patterns, such as students who have begun to accumulate frequent absence or if new or different people are waiting to pick up the student.
- 3. Changes in physical appearance, such as students who show signs of physical trauma, malnourishment, branding/tattooing, or drug use.
- 4. Students experiencing mood swings, including signs of irritability, panic or shame that weren't there before.
- 5. Students who suddenly have new gadgets, designer clothes, other types of material items they didn't have before.
- 6. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 7. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 8. Any comments by students that suggest they are exchanging sex for money, material items, shelter, etc.

¹⁴⁴ See United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons (2018)*, available at https://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/2018/GLOTiP_2018_BOOK_web_small.pdf.

BUS PERSONNEL: COMMERCIAL

- 1. Does not know the person who purchased their ticket, who is picking them up, or who is traveling with them.
- 2. No control of travel identification or documents or money.
- 3. Traveling on a last-minute booking paid by someone else in cash.
- 4. No freedom of movement or social interaction.
- 5. Traveling with little or no personal items such as luggage or bags.
- 6. Traveling with minimal personal items but carrying condoms, hotel key cards, gift cards.
- 7. Minors traveling without adult supervision.
- 8. Minors traveling during the school day.
- 9. Minor does not appear to be accompanied by their legitimate parent or guardian.
- 10. A child/person within a family appearing particularly unkempt and uncared for.
- 11. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 12. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking for them).
- 13. Traveling to obtain a job with no specific information, such as who will be meeting them.
- 14. Has no logical means of reaching, or lacks knowledge of, final destination.
- 15. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 16. Does not know their home or work address.
- 17. May speak of a modeling, acting, or labor job without knowing who will meet them.
- 18. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 19. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 20. Offers to exchange sex for a ride, meal, or help.
- 21. Signs of bedding in odd locations (i.e., backroom of a store).

PORT AND MARITIME PERSONNEL

- 1. Does not know the person who purchased their ticket, who is picking them up, or who is traveling with them.
- 2. No control of travel identification or documents or money.
- 3. Traveling on a last-minute booking paid by someone else in cash.
- 4. Traveling with little or no personal items such as luggage or bags.
- 5. Traveling with minimal personal items but carrying condoms, hotel key cards, gift cards.
- 6. Minors traveling without adult supervision.
- 7. Minor does not appear to be accompanied by their legitimate parent or guardian.
- 8. A child/person within a family appearing particularly unkempt and uncared for.
- 9. No freedom of movement or social interaction.
- 10. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 11. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking for them).
- 12. Traveling to obtain a job with no specific information, such as who will be meeting them.

- 13. Has no logical means of reaching, or lacks knowledge of, final destination.
- 14. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 15. Does not know their home or work address.
- 16. May speak of a modeling, acting, or labor job without knowing who will meet them.
- 17. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 18. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 19. Signs of bedding in odd locations (i.e., backroom of a store).

RAIL PERSONNEL

- 1. Does not know the person who purchased their ticket, who is picking them up, or who is traveling with them.
- 2. No control of travel identification or documents or money.
- 3. Traveling on a last-minute booking paid by someone else in cash.
- 4. Traveling with little or no personal items such as luggage or bags.
- 5. Traveling with minimal personal items but carrying condoms, hotel key cards, gift cards.
- 6. Minors traveling without adult supervision.
- 7. Minors traveling during the school day.
- 8. Minor does not appear to be accompanied by their legitimate parent or guardian.
- 9. A child/person within a family appearing particularly unkempt and uncared for.
- 10. No freedom of movement or social interaction.
- 11. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 12. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking for them).
- 13. Traveling to obtain a job with no specific information, such as who will be meeting them.
- 14. Has no logical means of reaching, or lacks knowledge of, final destination.
- 15. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 16. Does not know their home or work address.
- 17. May speak of a modeling, acting, or labor job without knowing who will meet them.
- 18. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 19. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 20. Offers to exchange sex for a ticket, meal, or help.
- 21. Signs of bedding in odd locations (i.e., backroom of a store).

TAXI AND RIDESHARE PERSONNEL

- 1. Does not know the person who purchased their ride, is picking them up, or is traveling with them.
- 2. No control of travel identification or documents or money.
- 3. Minors traveling during the school day.

- 4. Minor does not appear to be accompanied by their legitimate parent or guardian.
- 5. A child/person within a family appearing particularly unkempt and uncared for.
- 6. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 7. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking for them).
- 8. Traveling to obtain a job with no specific information, such as who will be meeting them.
- 9. Has no logical means of reaching, or lacks knowledge of, final destination.
- 10. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 11. Does not know their home or work address.
- 12. May speak of a modeling, acting, or labor job without knowing who will meet them.
- 13. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 14. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 15. Offers to exchange sex for a ride, meal, or help.
- 16. Signs of bedding in odd locations (i.e., backroom of a store).

TRANSIT PERSONNEL

- 1. Does not know the person who purchased their ticket, is meeting them, or is traveling with them.
- 2. No control of travel identification or documents or money.
- 3. Minors traveling during the school day.
- 4. Minor does not appear to be accompanied by their legitimate parent or guardian.
- 5. A child/person within a family appearing particularly unkempt and uncared for.
- 6. No freedom of movement or social interaction.
- 7. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 8. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking for them).
- 9. Traveling to obtain a job with no specific information, such as who will be meeting them.
- 10. Has no logical means of reaching, or lacks knowledge of, final destination.
- 11. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 12. Does not know their home or work address.
- 13. May speak of a modeling, acting, or labor job without knowing who will meet them.
- 14. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 15. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 16. Offers to exchange sex for a ride, meal, or help.
- 17. Signs of bedding in odd locations (i.e., backroom of a store).

TRUCKING PERSONNEL

- 1. CB chatter about "commercial company" or flashing lights signaling "buyer" location.
- 2. A work site that has heavy or excessive security measures that seem out of place.

- 3. A van or RV out by trucks that seems out of place.
- 4. A vehicle dropping someone off at a truck and picking them up 15-20 minutes later.
- 5. May go from truck to truck or appear to be operating multiple trucks at once.
- 6. A highly controlled and/or hazardous, unsafe work setting (may contain sub-standard, unsafe and closely monitored housing).
- 7. Does not know the person who purchased their ticket/ride, is picking them up, or is traveling with them.
- 8. No control of travel identification or documents or money.
- 9. Traveling with minimal personal items but carrying condoms, hotel key cards, gift cards.
- 10. Minors traveling without adult supervision.
- 11. Minors traveling during the school day.
- 12. No freedom of movement or social interaction.
- 13. Controlled or unusually submissive to a traveling companion.
- 14. Not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on speaking for them).
- 15. Does not know what city they are in or where they have been.
- 16. Does not know their home or work address.
- 17. Works excessively long hours, is provided few or no breaks, and/or has indicated their employer is withholding pay.
- 18. Minors seeking to obtain an ID or individuals seeking to obtain an ID in a different name.
- 19. Offers to exchange sex for a ride, meal, or help.
- 20. Signs of bedding in odd locations (i.e., backroom of a store)