



**Asia-Pacific
Economic Cooperation**

2016/TWG49/019

Agenda Item: 12

TWG Independent Assessment Review

Purpose: Information
Submitted by: United States



**49th Tourism Working Group Meeting
Kokopo, Papua New Guinea
31 August – 1 September 2016**

**INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT OF THE
TOURISM WORKING GROUP (TWG)**

TWG Response

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE	SCE Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)	TWG Response and Implementation Progress
<p>Recommendation to SCE1.</p> <p>The SCE provide more guidance about its subject area priorities and weightings to be used in selecting projects for funding</p>	<p><u>APEC Secretariat:</u> There is work underway in BMC that aims to allow for better feedback about project selection decisions.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	
<p>Recommendation to SCE2.</p> <p>That the funding and evaluation process for individual projects with a low funding requirement should be streamlined to reduce the transaction costs being incurred</p>	<p><u>APEC Secretariat:</u> This recommendation requires BMC consideration.</p>	<p>To forward the recommendation to BMC for consideration</p>	<p>July 2014</p>	<p>Yes</p>	
<p>Recommendation to SCE3.</p> <p>That if multiyear projects are resumed the option of a program approach should be included to make complementary and related projects more attractive</p>	<p><u>APEC Secretariat:</u> This recommendation requires BMC consideration.</p>	<p>To forward the recommendation to BMC for consideration</p>	<p>July 2014</p>	<p>Yes</p>	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	SCE Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)	TWG Response and Implementation Progress
<p>Recommendation to TWG 1.</p> <p>That, in developing the strategic plan for 2016 – 2019 the TWG carefully assess the priorities as outlined by the APEC ECOTECH, Leaders statements and Ministerial directives and establish criteria to priorities the actions to be undertaken in the work plan.</p>	As per the recommendation.	During 2015	Yes	TWG adopted the 2015 – 2019 strategic plan that is in line with the priorities as outlined by the APEC ECOTECH, Leaders statements and Ministerial directives.
<p>Recommendation to TWG 2.</p> <p>That TWG assess concept notes more fully at the early stages of the process with particular regard to support from proposing economies and the funding requirements to achieve an effective project.</p>	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	Yes	TWG maintains its full assessment towards project concept notes in order to achieve an effective project. Concept notes are discussed thoroughly at TWG meetings prior to TWG endorsement. TWG is also fully aware of the importance of the collaboration among economies, and that the projects should be of the interest of all economies, not only of those involved directly in the project.
<p>Recommendation to TWG 3.</p> <p>That in the evaluation of projects for funding greater weight is given to those projects that are supported by funding from economies with an interest and commitment to the project. The goal would be to incentivise greater economy and other party commitment and investment in the projects that come forward to APEC for funding.</p>	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	Yes	TWG took note of this recommendation.
<p>Recommendation to TWG 4.</p> <p>That TWG give highest priority to those projects that have the greatest regional application and value.</p>	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	Yes	TWG continues to prioritize projects that have regional application and value in particular project that has a high impact in sustainable and inclusive tourism development and the capacity to generate greater benefits for all communities.

<p>Recommendation to TWG 5.</p> <p>That TWG place greater emphasis on knowledge transfer of best practices and research within the APEC community as a component of projects.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TWG endorsed a study on the links between Tourism and Inclusive Growth at TWG47 in Chiang Mai, 2015. The main objective of the study is to have qualitative and quantitative research on the link between those two and recommendations to achieve Ministerial directives. • The traveller-friendly airport project that is currently in its beginning stages emphasizes researching and transferring best practices from traveller-friendly airports to those that are considered less traveller-friendly. • Furthermore, TWG is actively involved in other APEC Cross-Cutting Issues and Initiatives, such as Travel Facilitation Initiative, that imply the transfer of knowledge among multiple stakeholders.
<p>Recommendation to TWG 6.</p> <p>That TWG explore more of a program approach to projects so that the results of each project inform the next project to increase the benefit resulting from each project.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Each TWG project is linked to a specific objective in the Strategic Plan to ensure that results and benefits are carried forward to the next project developed under that objective. TWG will seek building upon the expertise learned from previous projects.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 7.</p> <p>That the TWG invite a broader range of participants to its workshop to improve the connection with the private sector and also as a means of transferring knowledge into the host economy, That the host economy consider inviting peak industry organizations and tourism academic institutions to participate at workshops held alongside TWG meetings.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG will continuously invite and engage a broader range of participants to its workshops, including relevant private sector participants. The TWG already invites peak industry organizations, including the World Travel and Tourism Council, Pacific Asia Travel Association, UN World Tourism Organization, and Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development. The TWG will consider relevant academic institutions at future workshops.</p>

<p>Recommendation to TWG 8.</p> <p>That the ABAC Representatives be invited to participate in relevant TWG meetings and in the development of the TWG strategic plan as a means of strengthening the conduit to the APEC business community.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG will invite ABAC Representatives to participate in relevant TWG meetings and work with the representatives to determine how they can contribute to the Strategic Plan.</p> <p>TWG also prepared a State of APEC Tourism Report, a <i>one-pager</i> report in order to increase awareness on the importance of tourism among relevant stakeholders in particular business people.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 9.</p> <p>That the TWG Lead Shepherd in conjunction with the Program Director restructure the TWG meeting agendas so there is a clear distinction between agenda items that are for discussion and decision, and those that are for information only.</p> <p>For those action items, to circulate the papers well in advance, four weeks before the meeting to enable economies to consider their positions, consult internally and address any issues that may arise so that they are better equipped to represent their economies at the meeting.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The Lead Shepherd and Deputy Lead Shepherd, together with the Program Director, structured the TWG 47 to ensure clarity on which agenda items required discussion and decision. The agenda was circulated to economies for input one month prior to TWG47.</p> <p>The Program Director also circulated a request to economies for papers three weeks prior to TWG47 to allow economies time to review and discuss internally. The Lead Shepherd, together with the Deputies, the Program Director, and the host economy, will continue to strive to circulate papers as far in advance as possible.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 10.</p> <p>That the Program Director take a more active approach to seeking input to key agenda items such as the development of the strategic plan and decisions and responses around projects, While there is no restriction at present on written responses being tabled by economies at meetings, the Secretariat should explicitly seek written responses from economies unable to attend.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The Program Director will continuously take a more active approach to seeking inputs to key agenda items as well as ensure that written responses are obtained and tabled at the meetings.</p>

<p>Recommendation to TWG 11.</p> <p>That the TWG develop an agreed agenda of intersessional touch points between meetings to transact administrative business such as the finalisation of project proposals and concept notes seeking funding. This agenda should be agreed by members 12 months in advance and form the basis of an ongoing dialogue by working group members. It appears that there is often a rush to meet deadlines and that the meeting schedule is often not able to be aligned with the funding timetable for projects.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG will work to develop an agreed agenda of intersessional touch points beginning in 2016 to ensure that project proposals and other TWG work are discussed and completed as needed. This agenda can be built into the annual TWG work plan. The Program Director will follow up closely with executing agencies.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 12.</p> <p>That in the years when there is not a Tourism Ministers meeting, the second meeting of TWG in that year be scheduled to align with another working group as a collaborative meeting or with a SOM meeting to enable greater connection across the APEC working groups.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>In 2015, TWG46 took place as part of the SOM2 meetings held in Boracay, 17 – 18 May 2015.</p> <p>The TWG included similar language in its revised Terms of Reference: “One meeting each year will be held on the margins of SOM in the host economy.”</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 13.</p> <p>That, prior to the Ministerial meeting every second year the TWG should commission or internally prepare a “State of APEC Tourism” report for consideration and adoption by Ministers and as a contribution to the Leaders declaration and other agenda setting processes of APEC. To achieve this, the TWG should seek the support of the</p>	<p>TWG to consider and action, if feasible.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG47, held in Chiang Mai, 22-24 August 2015, agreed on an annual the “State of APEC Tourism” Report that has been endorsed by SOM for Leaders’ considerations. WTTC assisted in providing statistical information.</p>

APEC PSU and second seek assistance from WTTC and PATA as sources of statistical information.				
Recommendation to TWG 14. That the TWG develop a standardised reporting template for economies to present their tourism information to the meeting and as a contribution to the “State of APEC Tourism” report.	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	Yes	Now that the TWG agreed upon the template for the “State of APEC Tourism” Report at TWG47, it will consider at TWG48 a template for economies to present their tourism information to the meeting to allow it to be useful as a contribution to the Report.
Recommendation to TWG 15. That the TWG member economies consider the agenda topics of TWG and select their delegations with relevant expertise and knowledge to make a contribution to the dialogue on these topics at the meetings.	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	Yes	TWG took note of this recommendation and will encourage all economies to act accordingly.
Recommendation to TWG 16. That the TWG comprehensively review the Tourism Charter and in particular the actions under the four goals, by 2016 with a view to ensuring that the TWG mandate and its strategic plan align with APEC ECOTECH priorities.	As per the recommendation.	During 2015	Yes	The TWG has adopted its Strategic Plan for 2015-19. In doing so, the TWG reviewed and updated the four goals of the Tourism Charter and aligned its revised vision, mission, objectives, and activities with APEC priorities.
Recommendation to TWG 17. That APEC SOM take a stronger leadership and coordination position by supporting and enabling joint or back to back meetings of working groups and providing additional support to Lead Shepherds to coordinate with other working groups.	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	Yes	TWG supported this recommendation and encouraged APEC SOM to hold at least one of the TWG meetings back-to-back with a SOM meeting.

<p>Recommendation to TWG 18.</p> <p>That economies developing significant projects and multi workstream projects be required to consult with other relevant working groups and report on the connections in the final project proposal that is submitted for funding.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG continues to build linkages with other relevant fora for all its projects, and consults with relevant work groups during the concept note and project proposal development processes.</p> <p>TWG will also strengthen its participation in other APEC Cross-Cutting Issues and Initiatives, such as Travel Facilitation Initiative.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 19.</p> <p>That the TWG extend an invitation to the Tourism Unit of the OECD to be a guest at all subsequent TWG meetings and include OECD in the document distribution from the meetings.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG has approved guest status for OECD. OECD participated in TWG46 and will be invited to future TWG meetings.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 20.</p> <p>That the TWG consult formally with OECD, PATA, WTTC and UNWTO on the development of its draft strategic plan so that it is consistent and complementary with the work of these international organisations. In particular widely circulate the proposed implementation schedule so that there is an opportunity to partner with these organisations on key projects.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG had strong collaboration and close consultation with relevant tourism organizations, including WTTC, IATA, and UNWTO, in drafting its 2015-2019 strategic plan. TWG continues to engage those organizations in its work.</p>
<p>Recommendation to TWG 21.</p> <p>That the TWG explore and support a collaborative approach with other multilateral organisations to projects, where possible that will progress the mission of the TWG.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>TWG will explore and support a collaborative approach with other multilateral organizations for TWG projects and works where possible and when it would further the mission of the TWG.</p>